THE NEW YORK CITY COUNCIL’S RESPONSE TO THE MAYOR’S FY 2017 PRELIMINARY BUDGET AND FY 2016 PRELIMINARY MAYOR’S MANAGEMENT REPORT

As required under Sections 247(b) and 12(e) of the New York City Charter

Hon. Melissa Mark-Viverito
Speaker

Hon. Julissa Ferreras-Copeland
Chair, Finance Committee

April 4, 2016
Finance Division

Latonia McKinney, Director

Legal Unit
Tanisha Edwards, Chief Counsel
Rebecca Chasan, Assistant Counsel

Revenue and Economics Unit
Raymond Majewski, Deputy Director, Chief Economist
Emre Edev, Assistant Director
Paul Sturm, Unit Head
Maria Enache
William Kyeremateng
Kendall Stephenson
Davis Winslow

Budget Unit
Regina Poreda Ryan, Deputy Director
Nathan Toth, Deputy Director
Crilhien Francisco, Unit Head
Chima Obichere, Unit Head
John Russell, Unit Head
Dohini Sompura, Unit Head
Eisha Wright, Unit Head
Aliya Ali
Jessica Ackerman
Ellen Eng
Sarah Gastelum
Kenneth Grace
Elizabeth Hoffman
Jeanette Merrill
Brittany Morrissey
Nameera Nuzhat
Steve Riester
Jonathan Seltzer
James Subudhi
Brandon West
Rui Xu

Discretionary Funding and Data Support Unit
Paul Scimone, Deputy Director
James Reyes
Prince Mensah

Administrative Support Unit
Nicole Anderson
Maria Pagan
Roberta Caturano
# Table of Contents

**Executive Summary** ........................................................................................................................................... 1

**Fiscal 2017 Financial Plan** .................................................................................................................................. 5

- A Responsible Budget – Impact of the Council’s Proposals on the Financial Plan ................................................. 5
- Funding the Financial Plan: The Council Forecast .................................................................................................. 6

  - National Economy ........................................................................................................................................ 7
  - City Economic Forecast ................................................................................................................................. 8
  - Tax Revenue Forecast .................................................................................................................................. 9
- Funding the Financial Plan: Savings and Re-estimates ............................................................................................. 10
- Funding the Financial Plan: Risks ..................................................................................................................... 10

  - The Economy ................................................................................................................................................ 10

  - The New York State Budget ......................................................................................................................... 11
  - CUNY ............................................................................................................................................................. 11
  - Medicaid ....................................................................................................................................................... 11
  - Sales Tax Asset Receivable (STAR) Corporation Debt ................................................................................. 11
- The Senate’s Two Percent Property Tax Levy Cap ................................................................................................. 11
- Health and Hospitals ....................................................................................................................................... 11

**Ensuring Opportunities for Our Youth** ................................................................................................................ 13

- Baseline and Develop Work, Learn, Grow ............................................................................................................. 13
- Expand the Summer Youth Employment Program ............................................................................................. 15
- Overhaul the Summer Youth Employment Program ........................................................................................... 16
- Support and Strengthen Career and Technical Education Programs ................................................................. 17
- Expand Career and Technical Education programming for Emergency Medical Technician Training ............ 18
- Increase Support for Beacon Programs ........................................................................................................... 18
- Expand COMPASS Slots for Elementary Students ........................................................................................... 18
- Restore SONYC Summer Slots ........................................................................................................................... 19
- Student Voter Registration Day Initiative ........................................................................................................... 19
- Improve Civic Education in New York City Schools ............................................................................................ 19
- Foster Care Discharge Grants ............................................................................................................................ 20
- Foster Care Extracurricular Activities ................................................................................................................ 20
- Eliminate All School Lunch Fees ...................................................................................................................... 20
- Improve Special Education ................................................................................................................................. 21
- Increase Funding for Girls’ Sports ........................................................................................................................ 21
- Recruit Bilingual Teachers ................................................................................................................................. 21
- The Middle School Quality Initiative ................................................................................................................ 22
- Create the New York City Social Justice Postgraduate Fellowship .................................................................... 22
- Pilot a Youth Tech Program at NYCHA ........................................................................................................... 22

**Supporting Our City’s Immigrants** ..................................................................................................................... 23

- Support and Expand Services for Unaccompanied Minor Children in New York City ........................................ 23
- Increase Funding for ActionNYC ........................................................................................................................ 23
- Baseline the New York Immigrant Family Unity Project ...................................................................................... 23
- Invest in Adult Literacy Programming ............................................................................................................... 23
- Support Complex Legal Cases ........................................................................................................................... 24
Improve Access and Coordination of Health Services for Immigrants ................................................................. 24

Budgeting for a More Equitable City .......................................................................................................................... 26

Promote Equity through Human Services Contracting ................................................................................................. 26

Promoting Equity ......................................................................................................................................................... 26

Right-Sizing Human Services Contracts ..................................................................................................................... 26

Pay Parity ..................................................................................................................................................................... 26

Create Wage Parity Between Child Care Providers .................................................................................................... 27

Pay Parity for Case Management Workers ................................................................................................................ 27

Right-size HRA’s Employment RFPs ............................................................................................................................ 28

Re-establish a Central Insurance Program ................................................................................................................ 28

Cultural Institutions Retirement System.................................................................................................................... 28

Launch a Financial Education Campaign .................................................................................................................. 29

Expand Caregiver Support Services ............................................................................................................................ 29

Examine the Informal Caregivers Community ........................................................................................................... 29

Create Food and Personal Hygiene Pantries at Community Schools ........................................................................... 29

Create a Language Assistance Program at the NYC Housing Authority .................................................................... 30

Allocate 1,000 Additional Public Housing Units for Homeless Families ..................................................................... 30

Engage HIV-Positive People in Shelters ................................................................................................................... 30

Support Critical Mental Health Programs .................................................................................................................. 30

Study Potential for Supervised Injection Facilities in NYC ........................................................................................ 31

Crystal Methamphetamine Project ................................................................................................................................ 31

Expand Warrant Reduction Programs ....................................................................................................................... 31

Support Summons Reform .......................................................................................................................................... 32

Ensure Availability of Social Services in High Crime Areas .......................................................................................... 32

Intensive Anti-Violence Programming on Rikers Island ............................................................................................. 32

Translate Emergency Notifications ............................................................................................................................. 32

Expand the Child Care Tax Credit and Include Adult Dependents .............................................................................. 32

EITC for Those Without Custodial Children ............................................................................................................. 33

Exempt Feminine Hygiene Products from the City’s Sales Tax .................................................................................. 33

Restructure the Commercial Rent Tax ....................................................................................................................... 34

Targeted Property Tax Relief ....................................................................................................................................... 34

Young Women’s Initiative – Private, Public Partnership ............................................................................................ 35

Safeguarding the City’s Programs and Services Through Budget Stability .............................................................. 36

Building Reserves ....................................................................................................................................................... 36

Allow New York City to Create a Rainy Day Fund ........................................................................................................ 36

Establish Rules to Govern the Retiree Health Benefits Trust ..................................................................................... 36

Carried Interest and the Mansion Tax ........................................................................................................................ 37

Open Budget ................................................................................................................................................................. 37

Improve Transparency of the Five-Year School Capital Plan .................................................................................... 37

Improve the Education Capital Planning Process ...................................................................................................... 38

Ensure Transparency and Accountability in ThriveNYC ............................................................................................ 38

Establish Neighborhood Commitment Plans ............................................................................................................ 38

Capital Projects Tracker for Rezoned Neighborhoods ................................................................................................ 39

Building for Our City’s Future ..................................................................................................................................... 40
Address the Capital Needs of the City’s Libraries ................................................................. 40
Richmond University Medical Center Emergency Room Renovation ........................................ 40
Complete Priority Education Projects ..................................................................................... 40
School Bathroom Upgrades .................................................................................................... 40
Air Condition Schools ................................................................................................................ 41
Purchase Large Front End Loaders ........................................................................................... 41
Increase Funding to Replace DSNY Vehicles ........................................................................ 41
Graffiti Removal ........................................................................................................................ 41
Build Out the Bicycle On-Street Network ............................................................................... 42
Expand Citi Bike .......................................................................................................................... 42
Improve Street Reconstruction ................................................................................................. 42
Reconstruct Arterial Streets to Fulfill the City’s Pedestrian Safety Action Plan ....................... 42
Improve NYCHA Facilities ........................................................................................................ 42
Construct a Department of Correction Training Academy ..................................................... 43
Renovate the Emergency Medical Services Academy ............................................................. 43
Construct Three New Emergency Medical Services Stations ............................................... 43
Renovate Firehouses .................................................................................................................. 44
Build Animal Shelters in Queens and the Bronx ....................................................................... 44
Invest in a Sustainable Regional Food System ........................................................................ 44
Baselining City Priorities ............................................................................................................ 45
Expanding and Enhancing Vital City Services ....................................................................... 46
Create an Office for Crime Victims Services ........................................................................... 46
Create an Office to End Gun Violence ..................................................................................... 46
Civilianize 200 Positions at the Police Department ................................................................. 46
Create a Municipal Department of Transitional Services ....................................................... 47
Inspector General for Department of Correction .................................................................... 47
Fully Fund District Attorneys Budget Needs ........................................................................... 47
Provide Video Visitations .......................................................................................................... 47
Expand the Mayor’s Action Plan for Neighborhood Safety ...................................................... 48
Enhance the New York City Crisis Management System ......................................................... 48
Implement Additional Emergency Medical Services Tours .................................................... 48
Enhance NYC Emergency Management’s Ability to Response to Emergencies ................. 49
Hire More School Crossing Guards ......................................................................................... 49
Expand the Nurse-Family Partnership ...................................................................................... 49
Establish a Neighborhood Naturally Occurring Retirement Communities Program ............ 49
Support Naturally Occurring Retirement Communities ........................................................... 50
Enhance Access Health NYC ................................................................................................... 50
Coordinate PrEP Services at Syringe Exchange Program Sites ............................................. 50
Expand Turf Maintenance Crew ............................................................................................... 50
Expand Seasonal Staff ............................................................................................................... 51
Increase Funding for Playground Associates ......................................................................... 51
Increase Baseline Funding for the GreenThumb Program ...................................................... 51
Extend the Pool and Beach Season by One Week ................................................................... 51
Deploy Neighborhood Support Teams .................................................................................... 51
Improve Library Services ......................................................................................................... 52
Supports Arts and Culture .................................................................................................................. 52
Support Worker Cooperatives........................................................................................................ 52

Tracking the City's Progress .......................................................................................................... 53
Executive Summary

The Council is pleased to submit its response to the Mayor’s Fiscal 2017 Preliminary Budget and Fiscal 2016 Preliminary Mayor’s Management Report.

This time last year, the City had successfully rebounded from one of the greatest fiscal crises in the City’s recent history and was enjoying robust economic growth with increases in employment rates, wages, and local tax revenue. With increases in revenue and job growth, the Council’s budgetary focus was on responsible prosperity; creating a budget that was transparent, progressive, efficient, and equitable, and aimed to ensure access, opportunity, and justice for all New Yorkers. In furtherance of responsible prosperity, the Council was successful in securing new and revised units of appropriations, ensuring that there were no cuts to essential services or programs, and increasing funding for core programs. The Council’s efforts led to increased funding and headcount for the Human Rights Commission and the Police Department; creation of a year-round youth job program; an increase in the number of shelter beds for runaway and homeless youth; the restoration of funding for City University of New York (CUNY) Prep; the baselining of funding for Priority 5 vouchers; and launch of the restorative justice programs in schools.

This year, the City’s economy remains strong. City employment continues to expand with 2015 being the fifth consecutive year with over two percent employment growth. In addition, the City’s unemployment rate fell to 5.4 percent in February 2016, down from 6.3 percent the year before; the assessed value of real property has exceeded $1 trillion; and the Council expects to see a 3.6 percent increase in local tax revenue in Fiscal 2017. While the City’s economy is strong with growth predicted to continue, recovery from the Great Recession is continuing into its seventh year, and therefore the City must ensure that it is prepared for the next financial downturn that will inevitably come, even if not in the near future. In order to be fiscally responsible and practice prudent budgeting, the City must take steps now to build up its reserves and find efficiencies where money can be saved, while providing more services, programs, and opportunities to its residents. This can be accomplished by addressing inequality through responsible budgeting.

Addressing Inequality through Responsible Budgeting

Addressing inequality through responsible budgeting means addressing inadequacies in the type, scale, and accessibility of services, programs, and opportunities available to New Yorkers, all while advancing long-term budget stability and increased efficiency and transparency in the City’s operations. In furtherance of that goal, the Council’s response to the Mayor’s Fiscal 2017 Preliminary Budget will advocate for both budget stabilizing actions and for the inclusion of budget actions to address inequality in our City.

The Council’s Budget Response reflects the values and priorities expressed by Council Members and the public during the Preliminary Budget hearings, which mark the beginning of the Council’s official, Charter-mandated role in the budget process. The hearings give the Council and the public an opportunity to engage in a public discourse about the Mayor’s Preliminary Budget and allow the de Blasio Administration to reflect on its budget priorities for the upcoming fiscal year.

Throughout the entire month of March, the Council heard testimony from over 50 agencies and the public about potential changes to the Fiscal 2017 Preliminary Budget that should be incorporated into the Fiscal 2017 Executive Budget, and for the first time held a hearing on immigration services. During the course of the hearings, Council Members acknowledged proposals included in the Preliminary Budget that reflect both the values and priorities of the Administration, the Council, and the public. However, many Council Members also voiced concerns about the need for additional services and programs, the lack of adequate funding for existing services, the lack of opportunities for the City’s
youth population, the need for long-term budget stability, and inefficiency and the lack of transparency in agency operations.

To address those concerns, the Council’s Budget Response sets forth proposals to address inequality through responsible budgeting by focusing on the following areas:

- Ensuring Opportunities for Youth;
- Supporting Our City’s Immigrants;
- Budgeting for a More Equitable City;
- Safeguarding the City’s Programs and Services through Budget Stability;
- Building for Our City’s Future;
- Baselining City Priorities;
- Expanding and Enhancing Vital City Services; and
- Tracking the City’s Progress.

**Ensuring Opportunities for Our Youth**

With nearly two million City residents under the age of 18, the City must provide opportunities for all of its youth by creating new programs and services, expanding existing ones, and at the same time making certain that the City is maintaining equitable access to such programs. To that end, the Council calls for an investment in programs that would offer valuable services to meet the needs of, and increase opportunities for, our youth population. Recommendations include increasing funding for summer and year-round youth employment; eliminating all school lunch fees; increasing support for Beacon programs; restoring School’s Out New York City (SONYC) summer slots; improving civic education in New York City schools; increasing funding to allow more sports opportunities for female students; establishing a grant program for children who age out of foster care; and expanding the Career and Technical Education (CTE) program to include Emergency Medical Technician (EMT) training for high school students.

**Supporting Our City’s Immigrants**

With immigrants in New York City comprising nearly 40 percent of the City’s population and accounting for approximately $257 billion in economic activity in 2013, immigrant New Yorkers are part of what makes our City unique, strong, and resilient. Setting an example for municipalities across the nation, New York City continues to lead when it comes to addressing the needs of immigrants and foreign-born New Yorkers. More than 700,000 City residents already possess a municipal ID card, and the City has founded the nation’s first public defender program, guaranteeing representation to detained immigrants facing deportation. The City also has launched a public/private partnership that provides attorneys to unaccompanied minors and adults who arrive in New York, and provided other vital services for immigrant communities. In furtherance of our goal to support immigrant New Yorkers, this budget response calls for an investment in programs that would offer valuable services to meet the needs of immigrants with limited English proficiency, complex legal cases, inadequate access to health services, and those requiring workforce development.

**Budgeting for a More Equitable City**

With over 8.5 million residents, New York City is the most diverse city in the nation. Such diversity includes racial, socio-economic, gender, and sexual orientation diversity, among many others. The City must ensure that these diverse populations receive the specific support they need. To that end, in October 2015, the Council launched the Young Women’s Initiative (YWI), a multi-platform coalition aimed at supporting young women in New York City and combating chronic racial and gender inequality in outcomes relating to healthcare, education, the justice system, and economic development. The first of its kind in the nation with many similar initiatives aimed at young men of color, YWI seeks to address
inequality by ensuring that young women are afforded the tools they need to thrive in this City. However, YWI programs were not funded in the City Budget. In anticipation of the Executive Budget, the Council calls for an investment in programs that would offer valuable services to meet the needs of, and increase opportunities for, our residents. The Council calls for funding for YWI programs; funding to the Department of Mental Health and Hygiene (DOHMH) to conduct engagement and linkage-to-care health care, housing and other services for HIV-positive people living in New York City shelters; funding to the DFTA for caregiver support services; and funding for DOHMH to develop crystal methamphetamine prevention efforts that would include increased social marketing and training of clinicians and community service providers to incorporate crystal methamphetamine prevention into their work with people at risk of use.

Safeguarding the City’s Programs and Services through Budget Stability
While providing sufficient services and programs to City residents is necessary to address inequality and ensure opportunities abound, it is only one part of a multi-part process. To ensure that these services and programs are adequately funded and can nimbly evolve over time, the Council must utilize budget stabilizing measures while ensuring budget accuracy and transparency. To that end, the Budget Response recommends several proposals, including the creation of a Rainy Day Fund, which would allow the City to save during good times and use those savings to cushion bad times; and increasing appropriations to existing budgetary reserves.

Building for Our City’s Future
The City’s Capital Commitment Plan reflects the Administration’s priorities for maintaining the City’s core capital infrastructure needs. The creation of new infrastructure, and the repair or expansion of existing infrastructure, is critical to adequately support the City’s current and future operations. To this end, the Council calls for funding several initiatives that would ensure that the City’s current infrastructure needs are met and that the future expansion and evolution of the City’s operations will not be limited or compromised because of inadequate infrastructure. Such initiatives include additional capital funding for necessary improvements and repairs to New York City Housing Authority’s (NYCHA) 2,551 buildings, which provide affordable housing to nearly 404,000 low-and moderate income City residents in 177,666 apartments throughout the City; funding for the School Construction Authority to complete wiring upgrades to support air conditioning in aging school buildings; and funding to the Department of Correction (DOC) for the construction of a new training facility; and funding to the Fire Department (FDNY) for the construction of three additional Emergency Medical Service (EMS) stations to accommodate the increased headcount of EMS personnel and expansion of the EMS training facility.

Baselining City Priorities
Baseline budgeting uses current spending levels as the "baseline" for establishing future funding requirements and ensures that the City’s programs and services are adequately funded. However, far too many City programs and services are not baselined, and as a result, many of the City’s priorities are at risk of being inadequately funded or not funded at all. To combat this risk, proposals call for baselining several essential programs to ensure continuity and quality in the services they deliver and reassurance to the City residents who benefit from those services that they will not be abruptly taken away or severely reduced in the next fiscal year.

Expanding and Enhancing Vital City Services
The City provides a comprehensive and varied range of services to meet the needs of its diverse population, but, at their current funding levels, many City services are limited in scope or scale such that the benefits cannot be provided to the entire targeted population. Additionally, as the need for a service increases, so does the need for adequate staffing to deliver that service to minimize delays in service provision or prevent the absence of service delivery. Accordingly, this Budget Response calls for the expansion and enhancement of key criminal justice, community support, and human services. For
example, the Council calls for creating an Office for Crime Victim Services; expanding strategies and programs that are part of the Mayor’s Action Plan for Neighborhood Safety to other NYCHA developments beyond the 15 originally selected; increasing the Emergency Medical Services headcount at the FDNY; additions to the Department of Parks and Recreation of seasonal park staff; and adding funding for Pre-Exposure Prophylaxis (PrEP) education and referral services at Syringe Program Exchange sites throughout the City.

Tracking the City’s Progress

The Preliminary Mayor’s Management Report (PMMR) and the Mayor’s Management Report (MMR), which are both mandated by the City Charter, serve as public accounts of the performance of City agencies, measuring whether they are delivering services efficiently, effectively, and expeditiously. The PMMR provides an early update of how the City is performing four months into the fiscal year. The MMR, published each September, looks retrospectively at the City's performance during the prior fiscal year. Both documents set forth performance indicators and targets for such indicators, and indicate whether such targets have been met. While all City agencies provide services or programs to the public, many agencies and programs within agencies are not listed in the PMMR or MMR, thereby making it difficult for the public to track the performance of City agencies’ administration in those areas. For agencies that do include performance indicators, additional metrics are necessary to gain a comprehensive understanding of the successes or challenges that such agencies are experiencing in administering the program or service. In this Budget Response, the Council calls for additional indicators in several agencies, including metrics for the New York City Taxpayer Advocate’s Office within the Department of Finance (DOF) to allow the public to know the types of inquiries received by the office, response times to such inquiries, and resolution times of such inquiries; metrics for the Board of Standards and Appeals (BSA) application processing and resolution times; and metrics for DOF’s newly created Business E-services system to include the number of people who pay on-line, file returns on-line, and statistics of delinquency rate of people who pay on-line.

The Council’s Budget Response

The Council's proposals, as outlined in the Budget Response, reflect cautious and prudent budgeting. It is our hope that the Fiscal 2017 Executive Budget, and ultimately the Adopted Budget, will be presented in a way that reflects the City's values and priorities, and addresses inequality through responsible budgeting.

We look forward to continuing to serve the residents of this great City, and anticipate that the recommendations provided in our Budget Response will not only increase the quality of City services, but will also increase opportunities for all New Yorkers.
Fiscal 2017 Financial Plan

The Fiscal 2017 Preliminary Budget totals $82.1 billion. This includes $59.9 billion in City funds, which is revenue from City taxes, fees, fines and other non-tax revenue. City funds are up 2.8 percent between Fiscal 2016 and Fiscal 2017. As required by law the budget is balanced for Fiscal 2016 and Fiscal 2017. Outyear gaps are modest and of the size that have proven to be easy to close in a healthy economy.  

A Responsible Budget – Impact of the Council’s Proposals on the Financial Plan

The Council’s Response is consistent with prudent budgeting. Overall, the total of new spending and tax reductions proposed is $790 million. This is, however, offset by $355 million in debt service and agency savings for a net change of $395 million. The Council’s Response includes approximately $101 million in targeted tax reductions in Fiscal 2017. Because so much of this is paid for by savings and increased prepayments from Fiscal 2016, the increase in the Fiscal 2017 budget is very small - around $127 million.

The increase in services and the tax reductions in the Council’s Budget Response are funded from two sources: savings from cost re-estimates of programs already in the financial plan, and additional

1 This is an updated and abbreviated version of the Finance Division’s forecast found in “Financial Plan Overview, Economy, Revenue, Pensions, Capital and Debt Service” released as part of the Finance Committee’s March 1, 2016 Hearing on the Mayor’s Fiscal 2017 Preliminary Budget.

2 Expanding the Child Care Credit would not take effect to Fiscal 2018. It costs $42 million.
collections from the Council’s tax revenue forecast. Some of these resources have been dedicated to addressing a risk in the New York State Budget, a reduction in New York City sales tax revenue related to the Sales Tax Asset Receivables Corporation (STARC) refinancing. This is discussed in the risk section below.

### Table 2: Changes to Preliminary Budget due to State Budget & Council Response

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Fiscal 2016</th>
<th>Fiscal 2017</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>January Plan Gap</td>
<td>$0</td>
<td>$0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Funding the Financial Plan Increase/(Decrease)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Council Revenue Forecast</td>
<td>$185</td>
<td>$418</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New York State Budget STARC Impact on Sales Tax</td>
<td>$(50)</td>
<td>$(200)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Debt Service Savings</td>
<td></td>
<td>$250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agency Savings and Data Processing Equipment Savings</td>
<td></td>
<td>$105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General Reserve</td>
<td></td>
<td>$300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Funding</strong></td>
<td><strong>$435</strong></td>
<td><strong>$573</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Programs Funded</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ensuring Opportunities for Our Youth</td>
<td></td>
<td>$268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting Our City’s Immigrants</td>
<td></td>
<td>$51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budgeting for a More Equitable City</td>
<td></td>
<td>$248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safeguarding the City’s Programs and Services Through Budget Stability *</td>
<td></td>
<td>$223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expanding and Enhancing Vital City Services</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Programs Funded</strong></td>
<td><strong>$0</strong></td>
<td><strong>$790</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Additional Prepayment Of 2016 Expense</strong></td>
<td><strong>$435</strong></td>
<td><strong>($435)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Surplus/(Gap)</strong></td>
<td><strong>$0</strong></td>
<td><strong>$218</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*There are tax increases proposed in this document for reasons of equity, and if they are enacted would be used to build budgetary reserves and to deal with long run budget issues. They are not included in the financial plan.

Even with the Council’s proposed additions, the budget has a surplus in Fiscal 2017 of $258 million.

### Funding the Financial Plan: The Council Forecast

The Council’s forecast is similar to those of the other agencies that forecast the City’s economy and tax revenue. The Council’s forecast of tax revenues for Fiscal 2016 and Fiscal 2017 is below those of the City Comptroller and the Independent Budget Office and above that of the generally conservative Office of Management and Budget. Below is a brief summary of the forecast.

---

3 These proposals include Carried Interest and the Mansion Tax.

4 This is an updated and abbreviated version of the Finance Division’s forecast found in "Financial Plan Overview, economy, Revenue, Pensions, Capital and Debt Service” released as part of the Finance Committee’s March 1, 2016 Hearing on the Mayor’s Fiscal 2017 Preliminary Budget.
National Economy
The US economy is expected to grow at a modest pace through Fiscal 2017 and for the rest of the financial plan.

The U.S. economy continues to expand at a rate comparable to the previous few years. Real GDP growth in each of the last two years increased 2.4 percent, although fourth quarter real GDP growth was only 1.4 percent. IHS Global Insight expects GDP to grow at 2.3 percent in 2016, bumping up to 2.8 percent in 2017, and slowing down a bit in 2018 and 2019.

According to the U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics (BLS), the labor market added 215,000 jobs in March – stronger than expected. Job growth occurred in health care and social assistance, retail trade, food services and drinking places, and private educational services. Over the past three months, job gains have averaged a solid 209,000 per month. Job openings are also worth noting, hitting a six-month high of 5.5 million in January. That said, there were 8.0 million unemployed persons in March, and the unemployment rate held at 5.0 percent. The number of long-term unemployed (those jobless for 27 weeks or more) was also unchanged at 2.2 million in March. These individuals accounted for 27.6 percent of the unemployed.

Wages (average hourly earnings of all employees) continue to climb at a faster pace than the cost of living. This means households have more purchasing power, encouraging consumers to spend more. From February 2015 to February 2016, real average hourly earnings increased 1.7 percent, seasonally adjusted. The Consumer Price Index for All Urban Consumers (CPI-U) on the other hand, increased only 1.0 percent over the same period.

U.S. consumers do not anticipate a recession, according to the University of Michigan’s Survey of Consumers, but they also do not believe the economy will outperform the 2.4 percent rate of growth seen in the last couple years. Consumer spending surged in January (up 0.5 percent in real terms) after a weak showing in December (up 0.1 percent). Household expenditures will remain solid and real consumption growth is expected going forward.

---

Even with the oft-cited worries surrounding the strong dollar, weak exports, low inflation, and instability in global financial markets, Federal Reserve officials still expect the economy to continue expanding moderately, and kept the federal funds rate unchanged at the Federal Open Market Committee meeting on March 15-16. All in all, the expansion is expected to continue at a moderate pace.

City Economic Forecast

New York City received a pleasant surprise in March. The U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics released its annual benchmarking of the City’s employment numbers, with full payroll data replacing a sampling of firms. What was previously reported as an additional 100,500 in 2015 compared to 2014— which itself is pretty impressive— was upwardly revised to 119,000, a 2.9 percent increase. The gains were broad-based. Professional and business services, which provide a wide gamut of decent-paying jobs, did not lose momentum, as was reported before the benchmarking, but accelerated its growth by a dynamic 4.5 percent. Finance and insurance which averages six-digit salaries, maintained growth of 2.2 percent. Health care remained sanguine at three percent. Leisure and hospitality, comprising lower-paying service positions, maintained very strong job growth of four percent, although a bit less explosive than the previous four years. Retail was the one disappointment, abruptly halting to almost zero job growth after five years of at least three percent growth.

The City’s unemployment rate fell to 5.4 percent in February 2016, down from 6.3 percent a year ago. The City’s labor force participation rate remains a concern at 61.2 percent as of December 2015, 1.8 percentage points below the dismal U.S. rate.

Average wage growth in the City has been less spectacular than job growth, and is estimated to have grown by only 1.6 percent in 2015. The average wage was pulled down by the securities industry, whose average wage fell by an estimated 1.1 percent from reduced bonuses, as Wall Street revenues fell 1.7 percent in 2015.

Real estate is a big beneficiary of rising employment and upward wage pressures. The increase in office-using employment has increased the demand for commercial development and leasing. In 2015, the Manhattan office vacancy rate dropped to 8.5 percent from 9.3 percent in 2014. Asking rents have risen to $71.58 per square foot from $67.70 a year before. Residential real estate has also benefited. As of the fourth quarter of 2015, the median cost of a house in Brooklyn rose 3.5 percent from a year ago to $740,000.

Looking ahead, the City’s dynamic growth is expected to slow down. Compared to OMB, the Council’s Finance Division projects substantially stronger employment growth through the forecast period, but with weaker wage growth. The Council Finance Division expects private employment to expand by 2.3 percent in 2016 and gradually slow to 1.6 percent by 2020. The average private sector wage is expected to grow by only 2.4 percent in 2016, rising to 3 percent by 2020. As mentioned before, Wall Street wages will be a drag on overall wage growth.

---

9 http://www.millersamuel.com/aggy-data
Tax Revenue Forecast

The Council’s expects that the City will collect $53.5 billion in local taxes by the end of Fiscal 2016. This would represent a 3.1 percent increase from last fiscal year. It further anticipates Fiscal 2017 tax revenue will rise 3.6 percent to $55.5 billion. Revenues from local taxes are expected to grow even higher in the outyears (Fiscal 2018-2020), averaging 4.3 percent.

The real property tax is expected to continue its healthy stream of collection, propelled, in its lagged fashion by rising market values. Personal income tax collections, however, will slow abruptly, as employment growth is offset by a drop in Wall Street profits in 2015, reducing bonuses and capital gains. Collections from the business income taxes (General Corporation and Unincorporated taxes) are expected to be flat at best in Fiscal 2016, due to the challenges from the strong dollar, weak exports, and a battered energy sector. The City’s business tax reform last year is expected to delay collections, as the new tax forms are still being revamped. After stellar growth in Fiscal 2015, Council Finance expects collections from the real property transfer tax (RPTT) and mortgage recording tax (MRT) to finally decline from their towering heights as the value of commercial properties sold finally softens, and interest rates begin to rise. Sales tax revenue is projected to maintain its healthy growth with the expectation of rising employment and wages throughout the plan.

In short, Council Finance projects additional collections compared to OMB. The increases are moderate by historical standards, and are well within the range of other government agencies.
Funding the Financial Plan: Savings and Re-estimates

There are a number of areas where OMB has overestimated costs. Some of these, such as debt service are perennials, and others are unique to this financial plan. Below are Council Finance’s estimates of savings available due to these overestimates.

**Debt Service Savings – ($250 million).** The Council recommends that funding for Fiscal 2017 Debt Service be reduced by $250 million, as these costs are overestimated in the Financial Plan. In the Financial Plan, the interest rate assumed for Fiscal 2017 on the City’s variable rate demand bond (VRDB) is significantly higher than expected true interest costs. Under the same assumption, OMB recognized over $220 million in debt service savings from VRDBs in the Fiscal 2016. The Council calls for a similar reduction for Fiscal 2017. In addition, the Fiscal 2017 Budget includes Revenue Anticipated Notes reserve funding of $75 million for short term borrowing to address potential cash flow shortages. The funding has not been used since 2004 and is not anticipated to be needed in the upcoming fiscal year. A conservative approach would reduce this funding by $30 million.

**Reduce Citywide Data Processing Equipment Budget – ($14 million).** The citywide data processing equipment budget for Fiscal 2017 which totals $280 million is significantly more than the five year average of actual spending. Agencies should reduce this spending across the board by five percent by renegotiating contracts, consolidating contracts, and leveraging the City’s massive purchasing power to bring the cost down.

**Agency Savings – ($91.2 million).** The Council has identified budget savings for Fiscal 2017 from the following Agencies that it would like to see incorporated in the Executive Budget.

- **Re-estimate the City’s contribution to Fringe Benefits for ACS and HRA – ($80 million).** Over the last two years, the Administration for Children’s Services (ACS) and the Human Resources Administration (HRA) have recognized additional state and federal revenue to replace City funds for employee fringe benefits costs. For Fiscal 2015, the combined total was $154 million and for Fiscal 2016 is projected to be $137 million. The Financial Plan should reflect this adjustment for Fiscal 2017, conservatively estimated at $80 million.

- **Re-estimate OTPS Spending at DOT – ($6 million).** Each year, due to the timing of spending or delay in program execution, an agency can experience under spending in various program area or the other. The Department of Transportation (DOT) is no exception; over the past five years actual Other Than Personal Services (OTPS) spending for traffic operations, transit operations, and executive and administrative functions have been lower than the amounts budgeted. As such, the Council has identified $6 million in OTPS savings in DOT’s budget, including $5 million from Traffic Operations, $500,000 from Transit Operations, and $500,000 from Executive and Administration in Fiscal 2017.

Funding the Financial Plan: Risks

**The Economy**

There are risks of an economic slowdown. A weaker national economy would reduce City tax revenue below the Finance Division’s economic forecast. This has been the weakest recovery since World War II, as seen in the fourth quarter growth of only 1.4 percent, following a tepid 2.0 percent in the third quarter. Labor productivity growth has been averaging only 0.5 percent annually since 2010, compared to 2.3 percent between 1947 and 2007. Given this fragile recovery, the economy is vulnerable to economic shocks. A weak global economy, market turbulence from China, and a battered energy sector all have the potential to further slow the economy or perhaps cause a recession. The Wells Fargo Economic Group estimates the chances of a recession in the next six months at 25 percent.
If the economy is stronger than predicted, there is a risk in the form of higher than expected interest rates. This could reduce or eliminate some of the debt service savings the Council is expecting.

Turning to the City sectors, increasing global weakness may further rattle the finance sector. A severe decline in U.S. corporate earnings may drastically reduce demand for the City’s business services. The strong dollar, weakness abroad and declining consumer confidence may discourage foreign and domestic tourism.

As in other expansions, the City’s growth trajectory will eventually face constraints. In the past, this has come in the form of higher commercial real estate costs. Currently there are millions of additional square feet of office space in the pipeline which are expected to become available in 2017, including the World Trade Center and Hudson Yards. This may soften the rise in office rents, depending on the timing. Another constraint may be the climbing cost of living in New York City from rising rents and home prices. Residents and prospective New Yorkers may reconsider what other cities offer in terms of matching income and cost of living.

The New York State Budget
The New York State Budget for Fiscal 2016-2017 is due on April 1st. As of March 31st, when this document was written, no agreement has been announced. The risks below come chiefly from the New York State Executive Budget.

CUNY
The Executive Budget proposes to increase the City’s share of funding for senior CUNY colleges from the current 2 percent to 30 percent. This would cost the City $485 million in Fiscal 2017. It seems likely, however, that the Cuomo Administration will not go through with this proposal.

Medicaid
The Executive Budget proposes shifting a greater portion of the increases in Medicaid costs to the City. The shift would cost the City $299 million in Fiscal 2017, $504 million in Fiscal 2018 and, $617 million in Fiscal 2019, with gradual increases annually thereafter. It seems likely, however, that the State will not go through with this proposal.

Sales Tax Asset Receivable (STAR) Corporation Debt
The Executive Budget proposes that the City pay the State $600 million over the next three State fiscal years, which comprise the savings the City achieved from refinancing STAR Corporation bonds. The City would lose approximately $50 million in Fiscal 2016, $200 million in Fiscal 2017 and 2018, and $175 million in Fiscal 2019. The State argues that it is entitled to the savings since it funded the bonds. It presently appears unlikely that the State will back away from this proposal.

The Senate’s Two Percent Property Tax Levy Cap
The State Senate proposes extending the 2 percent property tax levy cap to the City. New York City has an entirely different tax structure than the other State localities, and its property tax on owner occupied housing is relatively low. Capping the property tax levy would essentially eliminate the City’s control on taxes, and leave it to budget with no control over revenue. The levy cap is unlikely; however, if adopted, for Fiscal 2017 it would create a $764 million hole in the City’s Fiscal 2017 Financial Plan. Similarly, it would create a $1.5 billion hole in Fiscal 2018.

Health and Hospitals
The Fiscal 2017 Preliminary Plan included $337 million to cover for New York City Health + Hospitals’ (H+H) Fiscal 2016 medical malpractice and debt service payments. This funding is a one-time payment
that does not cover Fiscal 2017 medical malpractice and debt services costs. There is a significant risk that H+H will need assistance on a similar scale in Fiscal 2017.
Ensuring Opportunities for Our Youth

The Fiscal 2017 Preliminary Budget for the Department of Youth and Community Development (DYCD) is $542.6 million, of which $486 million, or nearly 90 percent, is dedicated to youth services. Of this amount, $294.1 million is dedicated to Out-of-School Time programming, while $37 million has been scheduled to support summer youth jobs. The City Council has long provided funding to community-based organizations that serve youth, whether through afterschool programs, leadership development or paid work experiences. In Fiscal 2016 alone, to broaden youth services, the Council committed more than $68 million, comprising nearly 12 percent of DYCD’s Fiscal 2016 Adopted Budget of $568.5 million, for youth-oriented programming. The Council’s investment in Fiscal 2016 this year has expanded summer job opportunities for young adults, created new year-round work experiences for high school and college students, and restored afterschool programs for elementary students.

Council allocations are often critical for the expansion or enhancement of existing programs, and allow experimentation with new program models and growth of program providers. From the Council’s support for Work, Learn, Grow in Fiscal 2016, for instance, the City can take lessons learned and establish a better, permanent program. Such programs, however, cannot rely solely upon the support of the Council over the long term. Furthermore, the Council alone cannot bear the burden of supporting the expansion of all youth services provided in New York City. Families across the five boroughs still need more reliable, high-quality afterschool programming, and low-income neighborhoods still need improved wraparound services. Programs like Beacon community centers simply could not function if they were dependent upon unpredictable, single-year investments to cover operating expenses. The time has come for the City of New York to make a major investment in its youth, both financially and programmatically. Beyond DYCD, the Administration has to make a commitment to implement programmatic and funding changes to services for all youth both in and out of school with special attention to vulnerable youth.

Baseline and Develop Work, Learn, Grow

In Fiscal 2016, the Council took a new step toward expanding youth employment by establishing a year-round employment program for youth: Work, Learn, Grow (WLG). WLG has enrolled more than 6,400 participants from across New York City in job opportunities during the school year at a cost of $16.2 million. When developing this initiative, the Council envisioned a truly year-round job program for youth, with 12 months of work experience and professional development for all participants ages 14-24, regardless of school enrollment status or involvement in the SYEP. However, implementation hurdles and the need to quickly launch the program severely limited WLG’s scope.

According to the 2010 U.S. Census, there are approximately 862,000 youth ages 14-24 in New York City. Based on this data, the Census estimates that 75 percent of all youth in this age group are either not working while enrolled in school, neither working nor enrolled in school, or out of school and working in low-wage jobs. Given this information, the Council calls upon the Administration to baseline the Fiscal 2016 budget of $16.2 million. Further, taking lessons learned from the program’s pilot year into consideration, the Council calls upon the Administration to increase the total budget for WLG to $40.2 million to support long-term program improvement, incorporating the following essential recommendations.

10 The following proposals do not account for the State’s schedule of minimum wage increases, as this information was unavailable at the time of compilation. Figures for some proposals may need to be adjusted to include the planned increases to $11 per hour, effective December 31, 2016.
• **Run WLG Year Round.** In its first year, WLG ran for only 25 weeks, with some youth participating for as few as eight weeks. For the program to achieve its maximum potential, it needs to last longer, allowing participants to keep the same job over the summer that they maintain throughout the year. The Council calls upon the Administration to establish a truly year-round program. Further, the program should allow enrollment throughout the year if vacancies arise.

• **Include Out-of-School Youth.** The 2010 Census reports that more than 172,000 youth in New York City are currently out of school and out of work. WLG provides a prime opportunity to engage this population in workforce development and experience; however, due to budgetary restrictions, these youth were excluded from the first year of the program. Future iterations of WLG should include at least 250 out-of-school youth per year.

• **Maximize Youth Earnings.** As the program is currently designed, younger youth ages 14-15 may participate in programming for a maximum of six hours per week, while older youth ages 16-24 may work up to ten hours per week. However, if a participant cannot meet their maximum hours within a given week, those potential hours are lost along with that participant’s potential earnings. Although the rules were amended mid-year to allow participants to make up hours during traditional holiday periods, this change came too late for participants to take full advantage of the opportunity. Participants should have the flexibility to make up any missed hours throughout the course of the year.

• **Allow Younger Youth to Work.** While SYEP allows participants as young as 14 to work up to 15 hours per week, WLG does not. Instead, WLG offers weekly workforce development training to participants ages 14-15 in without any work experience. The inconsistency between programs places a burden on not only program providers who must deliver the training at a lower price per participant than they receive for older youth, but also on the participants, who ultimately miss out on the experience of working at an actual job site again. The Council recommends that younger youth be allowed to work up to six hours per week, rather than being limited to workforce development training only.

• **Reduce Orientation Requirement.** The first iteration of WLG required participants ages 16-24 to attend two full weeks of professional development training before setting foot on a job site. This amounts to 20 hours of training, which is five times the requirement for SYEP participants of the same age. The current requirements seem excessive and should be revised to match similar orientation requirements as SYEP.

• **Create a Year-Round Youth Employment Program for the Mayor’s Action Plan for Neighborhood Safety.** The Mayor’s Action Plan for Neighborhood Safety (MAP) is a comprehensive multi-agency effort to address public safety and community development in 15 New York City Housing Authority (NYCHA) developments. In Fiscal 2016, the Administration reserved 841 summer youth employment slots specifically for students in MAP developments. The Council calls on the Administration to add $20 million to create a year-round employment program for 3,000 youth who reside within the 15 NYCHA developments in MAP.

• **Enhance the Year-Round Employment Program for the New York City Crisis Management System.** The Council calls on the Administration to add $6 million to enhance the New York City Crisis Management Youth Employment Program. In Fiscal 2016, the City Council added $1.5 million to support over 300 summer and year-round jobs for youth involved in the Crisis Management System. The Council’s proposal calls for the creation of a year-round employment program to provide job opportunities for up to 800 youth who reside within the 18 catchment
areas. The program would increase the variety of providers and job experiences available to the participants. The proposal would also include job developers to find work sites and provide support and guidance to the participants. The job developer would work with the many community-based organizations, City agencies and hospitals involved in the Crisis Management System to identify and increase the number of job opportunities available to participants.

Expand the Summer Youth Employment Program

Recognizing the critical importance of the Summer Youth Employment Program, as well as the gap between the supply of and demand for positions, the Council calls upon the Administration to expand the program to offer 100,000 jobs by Fiscal 2019. To accomplish this, the Council proposes that the increase be phased in over the course of three years, with 60,000 jobs supported in Fiscal 2017, increasing to 80,000 in Fiscal 2018, and 100,000 in Fiscal 2019. Further understanding that the uncertainty created by increasing funding by millions of dollars at adoption inherently affects the quality of programming, the Council calls upon the Administration to baseline this funding in DYCD's budget.

The Fiscal 2016 Preliminary Budget included $33.4 million for the Summer Youth Employment Program (SYEP), supporting a total of only 21,898 jobs. Through vigilant advocacy by the Council, the Fiscal 2016 Adopted Budget provided paid work experiences to 54,263 New Yorkers between the ages of 14 and 24 – a program record – at a total program cost of $79.9 million, including an investment from the Council of $21 million. These slots served 41 percent of the nearly 132,000 applicants for the year. Funding for Fiscal 2016 came from the Administration ($35.9 million), the Council ($21 million), New York State ($15.5 million), federal awards ($5.5 million) and private donors ($2.1 million). However, the Fiscal 2017 Preliminary Budget only includes $37 million between City tax-levy and federal funds. DYCD anticipates $15.6 million of State funding for Fiscal 2017, bringing the estimated total budget for SYEP to only $52.6 million, and has indicated that this will support only 35,101 jobs – 19,162 fewer than last summer.

To accommodate the proposed recommendations for Fiscal 2017, this would require an increase of $41.2 million, bringing the total program budget to $93.8 million. This would not only restore the full number of participants from Fiscal 2016, but would also increase the number of jobs available for Fiscal 2017 to 60,000. To increase the number of available slots to 80,000 for Fiscal 2018, the total program budget will need to increase to an estimated $125.1 million. In Fiscal 2019, the total budget would increase to an estimated $156.3 million under the current six-week model. This expansion will require a parallel expansion and diversification of the SYEP provider pool so that the SYEP job options available to youth are meaningful and varied. Finally, the Council requests that the Administration include the following components in its Fiscal 2017 program.

- **Reserve 3,078 Jobs for Vulnerable Youth.** In Fiscal 2016, DYCD reserved 2,078 program slots for youth categorized as vulnerable, which included youth in foster care, youth involved in the justice system, runaway/homeless youth, and children receiving preventive services from the Administration for Children’s Services (ACS). While the number of reserved slots were nearly double the number of designated slots available in Fiscal 2015, several thousand vulnerable youth remained unserved. For Fiscal 2017, the Council calls upon the Administration to increase the number of reserved slots for vulnerable youth to serve a total of 3,078 this summer.

- **Expand Ladders for Leaders.** The Ladders for Leaders program is an alternative SYEP model, offering outstanding high school and college students ages 16-21 the opportunity to participate in paid professional internships with leading corporations, non-profit organizations, and government agencies. This program differs from the traditional SYEP model in that it admits participants on a competitive basis for more skill-based, internship-style positions. In Fiscal 2016, DYCD offered 1,035 of these slots after receiving nearly 2,800 applications. For Fiscal
2017, the Council proposes that the Administration increase the number of Ladders for Leaders slots by 500, to 1,535. This expansion should be paired with an outreach effort to encourage youth from all city high schools to apply to the program.

Overhaul the Summer Youth Employment Program

While increasing the number of participants served by SYEP is a high priority for the Council, the quality of the experience provided in SYEP is equally important. After more than 40 years of programming overseen by a myriad of federal and City agencies, SYEP is ready for an overhaul as there have been no significant changes to the programming.

In order to increase the number of jobs available, DYCD must likewise expand the number and range of program providers to identify worksites and match them with participants. Pre-placement assessment materials are outdated and ineffective for best matching participants with available jobs, while any previous participant work experience – even within the program itself – appears to have little to no impact on the type of job one might be assigned in a second placement. SYEP serves youth between the ages of 14 and 24, however, other than the five hours of workforce development training offered to youth between the ages of 14 and 15, there appears to be no differentiation in the types of jobs or programming offered between age groups. Participants of all ages are required to attend hours of unpaid training, regardless of any prior work experience, for which the standard materials provided are unsatisfactory and out of date. Moreover, to the extent that DYCD or providers conduct post-programmatic evaluations, they do not capture in-depth perspectives from participants, providers or employers. Providers themselves are underpaid for the quality and amount of work that is required for SYEP. Additionally, it is also unclear whether the current model of relying upon community-based organizations is best suited, in its current capacity, for tasks such as identifying, and working with wider networks of private-sector employers. In light of these considerations, the Council calls upon the Administration to overhaul its current program implementation model in the following ways:

- **Evaluate the Current SYEP Model.** External studies on participant outcomes of SYEP have been conducted in recent years by both New York University and the University of Pennsylvania\(^\text{11}\); however, neither study has assessed SYEP’s program implementation model. In order to improve the efficacy of the process and the quality of programming, a normative assessment by experts in the field of youth services and job development needs to review current practices to make the most effective recommendations. The Council calls upon the Administration to dedicate $500,000 to fund an independent external evaluation to determine the extent to which aspects of the program – from participant recruitment and employer engagement to program monitoring and evaluation – are working for everyone involved. Upon successful completion of the evaluation, it is the expectation of the Council that recommendations for areas such as participant training and program evaluations, among others, will be implemented.

- **Return to a Seven-Week Program Model.** In Fiscal 2003, DYCD took over management of SYEP after years of program management by a series of agencies as a seven-week program. In Fiscal 2014, DYCD changed the model and reduced programming by one week so as to accommodate more participants after three years of steep budget cuts. DYCD continues to maintain the six-week program model, despite an upturn in the City’s available funding. The Council calls upon

the Administration to return programming to its previous seven-week model. To serve 60,000 participants in Fiscal 2017, this would cost an estimated $10.7 million.

- **Limit SYEP to 14-21 Year Olds.** SYEP was originally designed to serve youth ages 14-21. In Fiscal 2010 and 2011, DYCD was awarded federal grants supporting SYEP under the American Recovery and Reinvestment Act (ARRA), which required SYEP to include older youth ages 22-24. ARRA ended in Fiscal 2011, however, DYCD has continued to include older youth ages 22-24 in its SYEP programming, allowing, on average 1,672 youth to participate in the program each year. At its core, SYEP was intended to offer introductory summer employment experiences to younger youth, not the longer-term positions that can lead directly to careers that participants in this age group require.

The Council calls upon the Administration to fund a $1 million pilot program in Fiscal 2017 to allow DYCD to partner with the Department of Small Business Services (SBS) and the City University of New York (CUNY) to create or expand 200 sector-specific, year-round paid internships. Positions should be supported by SBS-incubated industry partnerships in fields such as healthcare, information technology, construction, retail, food services or manufacturing, with the idea that interns transition into permanent positions.

- **Improve Vulnerable Youth Support.** Young people who have run away or are foster-, shelter-, or justice-involved require additional support in any type of programming in which they are a participant. Recognizing this, the Council calls upon the Administration to increase the level of base funding for providers per vulnerable youth participant in SYEP, from $400 to $600, so as to provide higher-quality wraparound support services, such as counseling and financial guidance. The Council projects such an increase to cost a total of $616,000.

- **Connect Career and Technical Education High Schools with SYEP.** In order for SYEP participants to gain the greatest benefit from their summers, they must make clear, definable connections early on between their six-week experiences and future career opportunities. New York City’s 50 dedicated Career and Technical Education (CTE) high schools are particularly well equipped to foster these kinds of associations. These schools already combine work experience, rigorous coursework and mentorship programs to prepare students for careers in a 21st century workforce. A pilot program combining these existing services with paid summer work experiences would allow schools to contract with community-based organizations to work with employers on their behalf while educators tie students’ summer opportunities to career exploration and project-based learning. The Council calls upon the Administration to fund a $1 million pilot program at 10 CTE schools across the City in Fiscal 2017.

**Support and Strengthen Career and Technical Education Programs**

Career and Technical Education (CTE) Programs are offered in 50 high schools throughout New York City. Schools with CTE Programs integrate academic study with work experience in order to better prepare students for the workforce. All students in CTE schools participate in work-based learning, exploring a range of career paths as well as complete traditional high school graduation requirements. Current CTE programs are offered in a range of fields from aviation technology and culinary arts to emergency management and multimedia production. CTE is delivered in two ways, either at designated CTE high schools or within high schools.

The Council is supportive of CTE programs, as they are a way for students to get “hands on” work experience while completing their high school education. While the CTE program is an exceptional model to prepare students for future employment opportunities. The following improvements are critical to ensure that its optimal benefits are obtained by its participants.
First, the Administration should work with the State to not only allow professionals to teach CTE courses, but also create a program that would license professionals who would like to teach in these programs. Current State licensing requirements are perhaps the biggest roadblock preventing the expansion of the CTE program.

Second, the Council calls on the Administration to ensure there is adequate funding for these programs. DOE should re-examine the Fair Student Formula to provide additional support for these programs.

Lastly, the Administration should fund a non-profit intermediary to manage the relationships between employers, educators and students as well as create incentives for employers to provide internships, mentorships and other work experience opportunities for CTE programs.

Expand Career and Technical Education programming for Emergency Medical Technician Training

The Department of Education has a single school, the FDNY high school that offers course work and training focused on fire safety, CPR, and fire-aid together with traditional high school courses. Students in this CTE program are guided towards careers in Department; as of 2015, 106 FDNY High School graduates have become State-certified Emergency Medical Technician (EMT). 28 graduates work for the FDNY, including two who serve as firefighters and 16 more as EMTs, with more graduates entering the academy each year. The Fire Department should collaborate with the Department of Education to develop CTE programs at several high schools to introduce students to careers at the FDNY and to provide a steady stream of certified EMT graduates ready to enter the Emergency Medical Service (EMS) training academy. It is estimated that the CTE program would an annual budget of $2.4 million to operate the program. Expanding this CTE program would provide a career path for New York City youth interested in working for the FDNY. Students enrolled in the program would also receive additional support from the Department with the process of becoming an EMT or a firefighter.

Increase Support for Beacon Programs

DYCD’s Beacon programs are collaborative school-based community centers designed to provide quality service to youth and adults after school, in the evenings and on weekends. The Fiscal 2017 Preliminary Budget for DYCD includes $39.5 million for all of the City’s 80 Beacons. Of this amount, $5.5 million of federal funding exclusively supports 14 Beacons at a rate of $407,000 each. The remaining $34 million supports 66 City-funded Beacons at an average rate of $347,000 each.

First created in 1990, Beacons were originally funded at a base rate of $400,000 per program, per year. Adjusted for inflation, this amount represents the equivalent of more than $800,000 in Fiscal 2016. Since 1990, a series of budget cuts and inflation adjustments have resulted in not only inconsistent, but also decreased funding across City-funded Beacons. The current funding level for these 66 programs has drastically reduced their purchasing power, leading to cuts in programming quality and staffing. While the funding level for federally-supported programs has remained consistent, these too have felt the impact of inflation over the years. The Council calls upon the Administration to increase the budget for all Beacons, including those that are federally funded, to $500,000 to support improved programming. The Council further calls upon the Administration to add ten new Beacon community centers. The Council projects the total costs of these changes to be $16.4 million, with $11.4 million supporting the increase to existing Beacons and the remaining $5 million supporting the new Beacons.

Expand COMPASS Slots for Elementary Students

The Fiscal 2016 Budget includes $324.8 million for afterschool programs for youth in grades K-12, the Fiscal 2017 Preliminary Budget includes only $294.1 million, due to the absence of Council contributions and funding for middle school summer programming. Over the past two years, the total program area
budget has increased by more than 93 percent, largely to give all middle school students access to afterschool programming through Schools Out NYC (SONYC). In Fiscal 2016, SONYC has grown to serve more than 65,000 students through 49,086 program seats annually. Seats for elementary students in the Comprehensive After-School System of NYC (COMPASS), meanwhile, have actually decreased between Fiscal 2015 and Fiscal 2016, from 47,123 to 42,540, respectively. Thousands of families citywide depend upon COMPASS programming to work or pursue higher education; without these programs, these parents would be forced to choose between supporting their families and staying home. Without any measurable increases in program seats over the years, thousands of other parents have faced this very decision.

For Fiscal 2016, the Council allocated nearly $8.8 million to more than 60 COMPASS programs, restoring more than 3,000 school-year and summer elementary slots that would otherwise have been lost through a new procurement process. However, this has done little to meet the high level of need for elementary afterschool programming. The Council calls upon the Administration to not only baseline and restore these to full-year seats, but to match the number of students served through the COMPASS elementary program to those served through SONYC. The Council projects the total cost of this to be $74.3 million.

**Restore SONYC Summer Slots**

The Fiscal 2016 Preliminary Budget included $27.7 million in intracity funding from the Department of Education (DOE) for SONYC summer programming. However, in an effort to increase its investment in Renewal Schools to $150 million by Fiscal 2016, the Administration transferred these funds back to DOE in the Fiscal 2016 Executive Budget and cut 34,000 seats from DYCD’s SONYC program for the summer of 2015, by which time parents across the city had already registered their children for programs. After receiving negative feedback from the public, the advocacy community and the Council, the Administration agreed to add enough funds to DYCD’s Fiscal 2016 Budget to restore its previously scheduled service level for a single year. According to DYCD, the program only requires $20.4 million to restore the 34,000 slots. The Council now calls upon the Administration to restore these slots permanently, at an annual cost of $20.4 million.

**Student Voter Registration Day Initiative**

The Council calls on the Administration to expand Student Voter Registration Days in our City’s high schools, with the goal of registering 10,000 students to vote. The current initiative provides funds for student voter registration and engagement at 56 high schools. Additional funding of $768,000 will allow for the program to expand to a total of 125 high schools, helping lead to a generation of civically minded and engaged youth across our City. A lead organization would contract with community based organizations to do the voter registration and education at high schools identified by Council Members. This outreach and education would include delivering presentations in classrooms on the electoral process and distributing and collecting voter registration forms.

**Improve Civic Education in New York City Schools**

The New York State requirements for civic education do not introduce students to the concept of community engagement until Grade 12, in a course entitled “Participation in Government and Civics.” While the standard curriculum covers the fundamentals of civic involvement and public policy, it does not actively engage students in project-based learning. Using separate funding, some public high schools in New York City have partnered with Generation Citizen, a national nonprofit civic education advocacy group that brings university students into classrooms to offer semester-long workshops in civic engagement. Preliminary studies of the impact of Generation Citizen’s curriculum have demonstrated a
positive effect on student civic knowledge, skill and disposition. The Council calls upon the Administration to increase support for supplementary civic education programs such as this.

Foster Care Discharge Grants

Youth age out of foster care between the ages of 18 and 21 and face many challenges but are provided limited resources to start their independent life. Through both ACS and Council discretionary funding, New York City once provided discharge grants to youth aging out of foster care. The Council asks that the Administration provide discharge grants of at least $1,000 to all youth who age out of foster care. Discharge grants could help youth to establish their life as independent adult by providing resources to purchase furnishings and afford other expenses. The Fiscal 2017 Budget should include $1 million for this program.

Foster Care Extracurricular Activities

Thanks to a recent change in Federal and State policy, foster youth now have the ability to more easily participate in “normative activities”, or activities that youth not in foster care would typically participate in. Previously, in order for foster youth across the country to do things that “typical” youth would do, like sleep over at a friend’s house, a background check would have to be completed on the parents hosting the sleep over. Recent Federal changes now require States to promote the participation of foster youth in age-appropriate activities as well as establish a reasonable a prudent parent standard for participation in extracurricular, cultural, and social activities.

The City should provide $2 million for activity grants. A grant of $200 would allow foster youth to participate in youth sports leagues, take a music or art class, and partake in a variety of extracurricular activities. Failing to allow foster youth to participate in everyday activities not only stigmatizes them, but also inflicts social and emotional harm. Enabling youth to play on a sports team or join a club (which may require financial resources) lets youth develop healthy relationships and better develop social skills.

Eliminate All School Lunch Fees

The Fiscal 2017 Budget should include $8.75 million so that the DOE can eliminate lunch fees in all schools for all students. Eating a nutritious lunch is essential for learning and developing, especially for those who may go hungry at home. By offering free lunch to all students, the DOE could increase participation and ensure all students eat a healthy lunch in school. The 2015-2016 school year is the second year that the DOE has provided all students in stand-alone middle schools with free lunch. In most other schools, DOE charges students $1.75 for lunch unless they qualify for free lunch according to the federal income guidelines. It is important to note that participation in universal free lunch has not resulted in a loss of Title I funding.

In schools with universal free lunch, student participation increased by at least six percent since the implementation of the program. Free lunch not only fights hunger, but also may increase academic achievement, and reduce the stigma and bullying associated with free lunch at school. Advocates believe that in many cases qualifying students do not participate in the program because of the stigma associated with receiving free lunch. In addition, they have expressed concern that many undocumented families living in poverty may not complete the school lunch form for fear of repercussion associated with this status. There is also a positive impact on students’ educational attainment when they have a healthy meal each day.

Improve Special Education

The Fiscal 2017 Budget should include $14 million to increase the number of Committee on Special Education Teams above the increased scheduled in the Fiscal 2016 budget. The Individuals with Disabilities Education Act (IDEA) requires that schools provide children with disabilities the instructional supports they need to attend school. IDEA governs how states and public agencies provide early intervention, special education and related services to more than 6.5 million eligible infants, toddlers, children and youth with disabilities. Based on the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act (IDEA), the DOE is in violation of this law by not being in compliance with mandated evaluations and special education-related services for students with Individualized Educational Plans (IEP) or for those who should be evaluated and subsequently could benefit from their results. It is the role of the Committee on Special Education (CSE) to provide evaluation services, create IEPs with the families and after consent from the parents or guardians to implement the IEP and then reassess the plan annually. According to the Preliminary Mayor’s Management Report (PMMR), in Fiscal 2016 there were 270,722 students receiving special education services, an increase of 9,931 students when compared to the previous year. The upward trend in special education services is projected to continue. As the number of children with special needs continues to increase, the number of CSE teams should increase as well.

Considering understaffing is the primary reason for the backlog we strongly urge the Administration to increase the CSE teams by a further 50 teams.

Increase Funding for Girls’ Sports

The Fiscal 2017 Budget should include an additional $220,000 for girls’ sports. According to the U.S. Department of Education’s Office of Civil Rights, the City would have to add 3,862 more sports opportunities for female students in order to be in compliance of Title IX laws. The DOE denies violating Title IX, but has entered into an agreement to resolve the complaint by adding $214,318 in Fiscal 2016 which increases at an incremental rate in the outyears.

While the Council applauds the DOE’s investment, it is not enough funding to provide young women with the sports opportunities they deserve. As national studies have proven, participation in sports decreases the chance of unintended pregnancy for high school students and improves the body image and self-confidence of girls. In addition, 80 percent of women who run Fortune 500 companies played sports in high school. Playing sports has also been positively correlated with school retention and decreases the chances of dropping out of high school, especially for girls of color. Understanding the importance and value of sports participation, the Council strongly urges the Administration to increase their commitment to address girls’ sports in Fiscal 2017 with an additional $220,000 to expedite the number of opportunities for NYC’s girls in sports.

Recruit Bilingual Teachers

The Fiscal 2017 Budget should include $265,000 to improve bi-lingual teacher recruitment. Last school year there were 1,157 bi-lingual instructors out of nearly 69,000 teachers, meaning bilingual instructors made up roughly 1.6 percent of all teachers. Chancellor Farina testified at the Fiscal Year 2017 Preliminary Budget hearing that it is a challenge finding bilingual teachers and we need to bring more bilingual teachers to New York City.

13 http://idea.ed.gov/
14 http://dayofthegirl.org/girls-issues/title-ix-sports-education-equity-guaranteed/
The Middle School Quality Initiative

The Fiscal 2017 Budget should include $5 million for the Middle School Quality Initiative. In 2011, the New York City Council’s Middle School Taskforce, in collaboration with the DOE, launched the Middle School Quality Initiative (MSQI) as an instructional intervention for improving literacy levels in middle schools in New York City. MSQI places literacy coaches in schools and uses a research-based literacy framework to provide on-site coaching and workshops for teachers in order to improve literacy among students. The overall goal of the program is that all children entering 9th grade will be able to read on or above grade level and that students are on the path to high school, college and career success.

Currently, 108 schools participate in the MSQI program, reaching approximately 54,000 students. MSQI plans to expand to an additional 17 schools next year. This additional funding would allow MSQI to add an additional 40 schools to the program, making the total number 165.

Create the New York City Social Justice Postgraduate Fellowship

There are relatively few opportunities for diverse and talented graduates of professional and graduate schools to enter municipal government in New York City. While the City provides excellent opportunities for college graduates through the Urban Fellows program, a nine-month combination work-seminar experience, no similar program exists for those who have completed graduate studies. The shortage of entry options negatively impacts the diversity and quality of the City’s workforce. The Council therefore calls upon the Administration to create a new one-year social justice postgraduate fellowship for 20 recent graduates of professional and graduate schools in disciplines relevant to the administration of City government, such as law, policy and social work. The Council estimates that a total of $800,000 annually should be baselined in the budget of the Department of Citywide Administrative Services for this program.

Pilot a Youth Tech Program at NYCHA

Public housing residents are served by a network of tenant associations that tend to be comprised of older residents. Young people who live in public housing developments are less likely to be involved and must be engaged on their own terms. The Administration is making inroads into free, high-speed broadband service in certain housing developments and should pilot a program to integrate knowledge and a concerted use of technology by a cadre of younger housing residents towards the benefit of their own communities. By doing so, diverse teenagers can also see themselves as producers of technology and in the pipeline for the growing tech sector in NYC. As a component of digital-based Request for Proposals (RFP), such as the recently launched MyNYCHA app for smart phones, NYCHA could incorporate a provision that the winning bidder work with youth and incorporate their feedback in developing digital technology and software. The Council proposes this program be piloted at five sites.
Supporting Our City’s Immigrants

With the share of the foreign-born population increasing, persistent inaction at the federal level for comprehensive immigration reform, and years of no increased funding and secured baselined funding for services in high demand, the Fiscal 2017 Preliminary Plan fails to meet the emerging and existing needs of immigrant New Yorkers. Due to these concerns, the Council calls for an investment in programs that would offer valuable services to meet the needs of immigrants with limited English proficiency, complex legal matters, and those with inadequate access to health services. Recommendations include making a major investment in adult education programs; providing support for complex legal services; improving access to comprehensive health services for immigrants.

Support and Expand Services for Unaccompanied Minor Children in New York City

Since Fiscal 2015, the Council supported the Immigrant Children’s Advocate Relief Effort (ICARE), a coalition of legal services providers funded through a public-private partnership that provides legal representation to unaccompanied minor children living in New York City.

The Council calls for the Administration to baseline vital legal services for this vulnerable population at $2 million in recognition of the myriad social services this population needs, as well as the expected surge in new arrivals expected in Fiscal 2017.

Increase Funding for ActionNYC

The Fiscal 2017 Preliminary Plan includes $7.9 million for ActionNYC, the nation’s largest investment by a municipality to prepare for executive action and a response to the need for nationwide comprehensive immigration reform. Given that funding for legal services through the Council’s Immigrant Opportunity Initiative has declined from its height of $11.25 million in Fiscal 2008 to $4.3 million in Fiscal 2015, and State and federal funding has drastically decreased, the Council urges the Administration to include additional $2.1 million for quality immigration legal services bringing the total spending for ActionNYC to $10 million a year.

Baseline the New York Immigrant Family Unity Project

Piloted in Fiscal 2014, the New York Immigrant Family Unity Project (NYIFUP) is the nation’s first program guaranteeing legal representation to low-income immigrants facing deportation. The Council currently funds NYIFUP at $5.23 million and to date, NYIFUP has provided complex, high-quality legal services for more than 1,450 immigrants and obtained relief for 452 clients who may now remain in the United States. Given the tremendous need for and impact of this type of legal representation, the influx of new cases, and the length and complexity of these cases, the Council urges the Administration to baseline $7.1 million for this groundbreaking program.

Invest in Adult Literacy Programming

According to a 2011 survey, only six percent of native-born persons in New York City ages five and over were not proficient in English, close to one-half of the foreign-born population in the City were not proficient in English. Many of these individuals are at the lowest literacy levels and require access to programs that offer Basic Education in the Native Language (BENL), English for Speakers of Other Language (ESOL), Adult Basic Education (ABE) and High School Equivalency (HSE) preparation. According to estimates by community-based organizations, at any given time, over 14,000 individuals are on

---

15 U.S. Census Bureau, 2011 American Community Survey-Public Use Microdata Sample. Population Division-New York City Department of City Planning
waitlists for such programs. Adult literacy and language proficiency are key elements to immigrant integration, leading to increased job opportunities and helping facilitate social and political participation.\(^{16}\)

The Council calls on the Administration to make a major investment by baselining $16 million in the City’s budget to create 13,300 classroom seats in ESOL, BENL, ABE and HSE programs. This investment would allow the City to serve half of those estimated on the citywide waitlist by restoring 6,300 classroom seats that were eliminated during the previous Administration and create 7,000 new classrooms seats.

**Support Complex Legal Cases**

Over the last few years, the Council has increased its support for legal services for removal cases, with the New York Family Unity Project (NYIFUP) working on reuniting families with indigent immigrants in detention and the Immigrant Children Advocates’ Relief Effort (ICARE) addressing the legal needs of the growing number of unaccompanied minors crossing the U.S. southern border. However, with the City’s focus on coordination for the implementation of President Obama’s executive action on immigration and 60 percent of pending cases deemed ‘complex’, legal service providers are restricted and prevented from providing flexible and appropriate services.

The Council calls on the Administration to provide $13.5 million in the City’s budget to focus on complex-case representation to supplement the services provided under the City’s ActionNYC initiative. Currently, the ActionNYC initiative does not dedicate funding for complex legal services. This would allow the City to provide services for complex cases where there is a major need and that require a significant investment in time; and with the flexibility to respond to emerging or changing circumstances, which happen frequently due to federal policies.

**Improve Access and Coordination of Health Services for Immigrants**

Immigration to the U.S. can mean changes in social and/or socioeconomic status, language, culture, and many other aspects of life that may affect one’s health. Research shows that access to health care is a challenge for foreign-born New Yorkers with language barriers affecting even those who have health care coverage, and foreign-born individuals are less likely to utilize preventive care.\(^{17}\) According to research done by the NYC Department of Health and Mental Hygiene, foreign-born adults younger than 65 are over twice as likely to be uninsured, compared to the U.S.-born (22 percent vs. 9 percent).\(^{18}\) In addition to the impact on the individual, lack of primary and preventive care for immigrants imposes significant costs on the public safety net in the form of avoidable hospitalizations and procedures.


\(^{18}\) Ibid.
The Council calls on the Administration to provide $10 million to support activities related to ActionHealth NYC and the recommendations from the Mayor’s Taskforce on Immigrant Health Access. The Fiscal 2017 Preliminary Plan does not include funding for these recommendations, with the City Council supporting areas of recommendation via the Access Health and the Immigrant Health initiatives in Fiscal 2016. This funding should support the expansion of ActionHealth NYC to provide coordinated health care services to uninsured immigrants; expand the capacity of community-based organizations to conduct public education and outreach on health care and coverage options for immigrants; support culturally and linguistically competent primary and preventive health care services for immigrants; and increase access to high-quality medical interpretation services.
Promote Equity through Human Services Contracting

The majority of the 17,600 contracts reflected in the City’s proposed Fiscal 2017 Preliminary Budget are managed by various human services agencies, including the Administration for Children’s Services (ACS), Department for the Aging (DFTA), Department of Health and Mental Hygiene (DOHMH), Department of Homeless Services (DHS), Department of Youth and Community Development (DYCD), and the Human Resources Administration (HRA). These agencies contract essential services that are core to their mission, and serve some of New York City’s most vulnerable populations, including youth, low-income and homeless individuals and families, individuals living with AIDS/HIV, immigrants, and seniors. Human services vendors and employees therefore serve as a vital arm of the City’s government, yet do not have the ability to design or set appropriate contract prices, or as de facto City employees, be paid equitable wages and benefits.

Promoting Equity

The programming and services that are contracted out to providers require a level of expertise, experience with, and knowledge of, the community and population that is being served. Current Request for Proposals (RFPs) and contract design practices in many of the City’s human services agencies awards a small number of high value contracts to large vendors that have the ability to leverage their expansive networks and resources to provide services. Smaller community-based vendors that have niche expertise are often unable to competitively bid on RFPS because they lack sufficient resources to administer large contracts, or lack the technical skills required to successfully compete for a contract.

The Council calls upon the Administration to reform current contracting practices at all City agencies, and in particular at human services agencies, in an effort to allow smaller community-based providers to participate in the RFP process. Allowing small community-based vendors to successfully compete in the contract process ensures that a community’s diverse needs can be met with the level of expertise and engagement needed to effectively provide services outlined in the contract.

Right-Sizing Human Services Contracts

The monetary value of many of the City’s human services contracts is not adequate to support actual costs to deliver services. Government contract awards rarely fully cover indirect costs such as overhead expenses, building maintenance, information technology, and employee training. While larger vendors may have the financial resources to cover these expenses, smaller vendors with limited funding are forced to operate at a deficit, which impacts their ability to deliver services, and limits their ability to compete for contracts.

In addition, multi-year contracts do not adequately account for inflation, wage disparities, or growing year-over-year costs to provide healthcare insurance to contracted employees. Many contracted employees in the human services sector are paid minimum or low wages, and cannot afford healthcare insurance premiums offered through their employer, or co-pays for doctor’s visits. Without adequate funding provisions reflected in the City’s contract awards for healthcare related costs, many contracted City employees are forced to forgo enrolling in health insurance that is provided by their employer because costs are too high, or seek alternative health insurance coverage where costs are less.

Pay Parity

Contracts also need to address disparities in pay rates for City workers versus contracted workers for comparable jobs. For example, staff and teachers who work at the Administration for Children’s Services
EarlyLearn child care centers make significantly less than staff and teachers who work for contracted Community-Based Organizations (CBOs) in the Department of Education’s (DOE) Universal Pre-K (UPK) system. The starting salary for a certified teacher with a Master’s degree in the Early Learn system is $39,350, whereas a DOE teacher’s starting salary with the same credentials earns $52,459. The Mayor continues to support increases in salaries for UPK teachers, including retention bonuses, but fails to address the wage disparities within the Early Learn system. This egregious example of wage disparity among these City workers, who are primarily women of color, makes it incredibly difficult for EarlyLearn providers to retain staff, as many will leave to work for DOE. This issue is further complicated by the fact that many centers have both EarlyLearn and UPK classrooms, meaning teachers can work under the same roof, doing the same work and yet have substantially different pay, which in turn creates animosity. By not addressing the wage disparity issue between EarlyLearn teachers and contracted DOE CBO teachers, the Administration is creating a dueling system, where there is no monetary incentive for qualified teachers to remain in EarlyLearn. This ultimately impacts the City’s poorest and youngest population, as EarlyLearn provides developmental and educational opportunities for children as young as six weeks old to four years old, who may not otherwise have access to such critical educational instruction by qualified teachers.

Another example of wage disparity can be found in contracted case management services. Contracted case managers across City agencies have different salaries, even if their credentials and experience are comparable. At the Department for the Aging (DFTA) caseworkers are paid less than caseworkers in other agencies such as the Department of Homeless Services. Currently, DFTA case managers are paid $35,000 and case management supervisors earn $48,000. Additionally, there is high turnover among case workers, approximately 32 percent of case managers leave after the first year and 50 percent leave after two years. This turnover impacts the quality and continuity of care that seniors, who are among the most vulnerable populations in the City, receive.

City agencies should recognize that as part of the contracting process that fair wages and benefits for contracted employees need to be factored into contract awards. The Council calls upon the Administration to develop metrics to assess proposed human services RFPs prior to their release, to determine if contract values are sufficient for the services that are required to be provided. In addition, current multi-year human services contracts should be evaluated to see if awards are sufficient to meet the needs for the current and upcoming years.

Create Wage Parity Between Child Care Providers

Throughout the City, EarlyLearn child care center staff and teachers make significantly less than UPK CBO staff and teachers. Qualified teachers with a Bachelor’s degree make approximately $12,000 more than teachers employed by EarlyLearn centers (excluding Head Start). For teachers with a Master’s degree, the difference is more than $15,000. The Administration should add $33.5 million in Fiscal 2017 and additional funding in the outyears to make the wages of approximately 800 Early Learn teachers and Directors and more than 2,000 support staff equal to wages paid Pre-K staff contracted staff.

Pay Parity for Case Management Workers

The Fiscal 2017 budget for DFTA should include an additional $12 million to allow DFTA to increase case manager salary to $55,000, and pay case management supervisors $65,000, compensation levels that are presently offered to case management staff at other New York City agencies including the Department of Homeless Services and the Administration for Children’s Services. Failure to add additional funding will not only worsen the case management waitlist, but limit the number of seniors that may receive homecare services, as case management provides the primary touchpoint for seniors to be linked to other DFTA services.
Right-size HRA’s Employment RFPs

On February 26th, HRA released RFPs for three new programs: YouthPathways, CareerCompass and CareerAdvance. These programs will provide employment and educational assistance to Cash Assistance applicants, recipients and other HRA service recipient populations who, by legal mandate or otherwise, engage in employment activities. They will also offer services targeted to the specific needs of special populations including older adults, those with experience in the criminal justice system, current and formerly homeless, immigrants, and members of the LGBTQI communities. Unfortunately, the programs outlined in the RFPs will fall short of being fully transformational, as there is insufficient funding in HRA’s Fiscal 2017 Preliminary Budget to support a viable cost per participant to provide the services requested. This funding shortfall will preclude innovative, diverse and smaller community organizations from applying for these RFPs, taking away effective competition from the process which points to a larger prevalent problem. The Council calls upon the Administration to increase funding for HRA’s employment RFP by $6 million for a total contract value of $135 million.

Re-establish a Central Insurance Program

CIP once provided general liability, workers compensation, health insurance, and other insurance for nonprofit providers who had contracts with ACS, DFTA, HRA, or DYDC. This included teachers, aides, cooks and other child care employees. Along with numerous City agency spending cuts during the Bloomberg Administration, CIP was reduced substantially in order to close gaps in the City’s budget. City Council is concerned that many employees of nonprofit providers are burdened by the high cost of numerous types of insurance. The City should examine whether re-establishing the Central Insurance Program would provide lower insurance rates for these organizations and their employees. The lower insurance costs would allow them to keep offering essential services to the City’s residents, helping bring stability to those in need.

Cultural Institutions Retirement System

The City has, for decades, paid the required pension contributions to CIRS on behalf of City-funded employees of numerous cultural institutions and daycare centers. Recently, the City changed the method of payment to CIRS so that the City provides funding to cultural institutions and daycare centers who will then pay CIRS. The City Council is very concerned that smaller agencies will not be able to handle the responsibility of paying CIRS directly, as this will certainly increase administrative costs. The City Council calls on the Administration to revert to paying CIRS directly.

The Council is also concerned about the long run stability of the fund. CIRS falls under the Employment Retirement Income Security Act of 1974 (ERISA), which regulates employee pension and welfare benefit plans offered by private-sector employers. Under ERISA, an employer that withdraws from a multiemployer plan must continue payments to the plan to help complete funding the plan’s liability for vested benefits. In general, “withdrawal” means the employer has permanently ceased operations under the plan or has permanently ceased to have an obligation to contribute. If the plan cannot collect, the withdrawal liability is reallocated to all other remaining employers. When another employer subsequently withdraws from the plan, they will be assessed their withdrawal liability plus a portion of the previously unpaid liability.

The reorganization of City programs, such as occurred with the implementation of Early Learn for daycare, has the potential to create such liabilities. According to CIRS, an unfunded liability of $64 million has been created by Early Learn, though to this point it has not be recognized or billed.

The Council urges the Mayor to work with cultural institutions and daycare providers to assure adequate funding for the CIRS pensions.
Launch a Financial Education Campaign

The Council calls on the Administration to establish consumer financial education campaigns targeted at populations including immigrants, seniors, women who are navigating the affordable housing process and living in communities slated to be rezoned under the Mayor’s Housing Plan. The campaigns should include advertising, one-on-one financial counseling and assistance with applying and interviewing for affordable housing units. Financial literacy outreach teams in different neighborhoods would provide the tools and resources in the form of technical guidance and specific direction to the targeted audiences to help them achieve financial stability and independence. Council Finance estimates a cost of $400,000, but this cost can vary based on when rezonings occur in connection with the Mayor’s Housing Plan.

Expand Caregiver Support Services

The Council calls on the Administration to allocate $4 million for caregiver support services. In New York City, approximately 1.5 million individuals are providing informal care. The Department for the Aging (DFTA)’s caregiver support services have been almost entirely funded by federal grants under the Older Americans Act’s National Family Caregiver Support Program. For over a decade, this amount has remained stable at around $4 million. DFTA’s caregiver support services are primarily provided through contracts with 10 community-based organizations located in each of the five boroughs. These organizations provide a wide range of services, including counseling, respite care, referrals, and therapeutic programming. By establishing a City funding stream (that matches the federal contribution) of $4 million for caregiver services, services ranging from individual counseling and support groups, to health and financial education, to respite care, can be expanded to benefit a greater number of individuals.

Examine the Informal Caregivers Community

An estimated 1.5 million residents of the City are informal caregivers, many providing dozens of hours of care a week. While public policy has focused on services for the person receiving care, caregiving exacts a toll on the caregiver, both financially and psychologically. Impacts include an increase in health risk behaviors, stress, negative effects at their own workplace, and difficulty in taking care of their own health needs. As with paid caregivers, informal caregivers tend to be female.

The Council calls upon DFTA to assess the caregiver populations’ demographics and needs through a needs assessment and informal interviews/focus groups in order to prepare a comprehensive plan for the caregiver population. The cost of the assessment is estimated to be approximately $150,000.

Create Food and Personal Hygiene Pantries at Community Schools

The number of low-income children in public schools has been persistent and steadily rising over the past several decades. Given this trend, children in families that are at, or just below the federal poverty guidelines rely on schools to provide their nutritional needs for the day. According to Feeding America, there is a national trend where more schools are opening permanent or mobile food pantries, where students who do not have enough to eat at home can take supplies back with them. Nationally in 2014, 1,141 schools had a food pantries program onsite, an increase of over 300 when compared to 2013. These types of food pantries are also being expanded to meet other basic needs, including providing personal hygiene items such as toothpaste and tooth brushes.

The Council calls upon DOE to open pantries in 10 to 15 schools located in districts with the high concentrations of poverty. These pantries would provide not only food, but personal hygiene products that students could take home with them when needed. The pantries would be restocked monthly, and
students could access supplies as need be with no stigma attached. The estimated cost of building and stocking a pantry is $35,000.

Create a Language Assistance Program at the NYC Housing Authority

The New York City Housing Authority (NYCHA) has a Language Services Unit that translates NYCHA documents and provides interpretation services to residents and applicants with limited English-speaking abilities. Despite these efforts, constituents from elected officials at the State and City levels have reported unacceptable handling of resident phone calls by NYCHA employees unsure of how to handle calls in a widely-spoken non-English language. As such communication attempts could have been in regards to a critical safety issue, a rent discrepancy or other important quality of life issue, proper handling of resident concerns is a must. To this end, it is important to provide NYCHA residents access to critical services in non-English languages, if a substantial number of residents of the development require services in that language. The creation of a language assistance program would require NYCHA to survey all of the residents in its 328 public housing developments to determine the percentage of those who are not English-proficient. If more than 10 percent of the residents in any development are not English-proficient, NYCHA should provide a language assistance program. Such a program would require NYCHA to hire additional staff so that every resident has access to a staff member who speaks their language. In addition, NYCHA would have to consider proficiency in the non-English languages spoken at the development as a major criterion in the hiring process, ensure that all staff members are trained to utilize the language Services Unit, and provide translation of all commonly used forms and informational materials. We call on the administration to provide $11.4 million to hire interpreters and translators to coordinate language access at NYCHA developments.

Allocate 1,000 Additional Public Housing Units for Homeless Families

Approximately 5,000 NYCHA apartments become available each year. Currently, the Authority dedicates 750 public housing units per year for homeless families referred by DHS and will increase this by an additional 750 apartments this year. In exchange for the additional units, the City will provide NYCHA with about $9 million, which is the same level of subsidy it provides to private landlords to house homeless families. In order to reduce the record level of homelessness (more than 58,000 homeless New Yorkers, including 25,000 children, stay in the City’s shelter system each night), the City Council calls on the Administration to designate another 1,000 public housing units a year for homeless families leaving city shelters at a cost of $12 million per year. This would represent half of the approximately 5,000 NYCHA apartments that become available each year.

Engage HIV-Positive People in Shelters

HIV prevalence rates in urban poverty areas are inversely related to socioeconomic status (SES)—the lower the SES, the greater the HIV prevalence rate. The Council urges the Administration to conduct outreach and engagement efforts among HIV-positive individuals in City shelters, helping to connect this vulnerable and marginalized population to healthcare, housing, and other services. Council Finance estimates this to cost the City $1,000,000.

Support Critical Mental Health Programs

The Department of Health and Mental Hygiene plans to redirect baselined Council funding for mental health initiatives to the ThriveNYC Mental Health Roadmap. The Council calls on the Administration to restore the $1.68 million in baselined funding for substance abuse treatment and suicide prevention it redirected to ThriveNYC. Specifically, the proposed budget redirects $125,000 from Bailey House, $247,000 from Samaritans of New York, and $164,000 from the Mental Health Providers initiative to
LifeNet in order to expand crisis hotline services. The Department also plans to redirect $525,000 in Chemical Dependency funding and $621,000 in Mental Health Contracts funding to ThriveNYC in order to expand access to buprenorphine treatment in primary care settings.

Fiscal 2016 funding allocated to Bailey House, one of the only community-based mental health clinics in East Harlem, supports substance abuse and risk reduction services for hundreds of individuals living with HIV/AIDS. Fiscal 2016 funding to Samaritans supports their 24-hour confidential suicide prevention hotline. Samaritans has operated the City’s confidential 24-hour suicide prevention hotline for more than 30 years, responding to more than 1.3 million calls, including more than 82,000 calls last year.

Fiscal 2016 Mental Health Providers funding supports contracts for bridge (transition management) programs, psychological clubs, recreation programs and respite programs. These programs offer community supports to New Yorkers with serious mental illness and their families at various stages of the recovery and rehabilitation process. Fiscal 2016 Mental Health Contracts supports nine community-based organizations in all five boroughs to provide a range of mental health services.

Fiscal 2016 Chemical Dependency funding supports contracts for Medically Supervised Outpatient programs (MSOPs). MSOPs are designed to assist patients in supporting abstinence and recovery from chemical dependence and abuse and typically offer a variety of services, such as individual and group counseling; individualized treatment plans; addiction education; co-dependency counseling, relapse prevention; psychiatrist and nurse on-site; and DMV referrals.

Study Potential for Supervised Injection Facilities in NYC

Supervised injection facilities (SIFs) are legally sanctioned rooms where intravenous drug users can inject pre-obtained drugs under medical supervision. They are designed to reduce the health and societal problems associated with injection drug use. The Council asks the Administration to conduct an impact study on instituting SIFs in the City, including an assessment of the pertinent legal barriers. The Fiscal 2017 Preliminary Budget allocates $82.4 million for the Chemical Dependency Program, including $28.6 million in City funds. A SIF impact study would cost approximately $230,000.

A 2014 study published in *Substance Abuse Treatment, Prevention, and Policy* and entitled, “A cost-benefit/cost-effectiveness analysis of proposed supervised injection facilities in Ottawa, Canada” found that supervised injection facilities in Ottawa appear to be an efficient and effective use of financial resources in the public health domain.

Crystal Methamphetamine Project

Emerging data suggest increasing rates of Crystal Methamphetamine (CM) use in the City among young men who have sex with men (MSM), specifically Latino and Black MSM. However, to date, the City has provided limited prevention resources to address this emerging problem. The Council urges the Administration to implement a CM Project to enable DOHMH to develop social marketing campaigns with an estimated cost of $200,000 and train clinicians and community service providers to incorporate CM prevention into their work with persons at risk of use.

Expand Warrant Reduction Programs

The Council calls on the Administration to add $400,000 to the Mayor’s Office of Criminal Justice to coordinate and organize ten warrant reduction events annually. The funding would support the City Prosecutors’ efforts to implement warrant reduction programs, such as Begin Again and Clean Slate and cover expenses related to coordination of the events to resolve open warrants, public education, and outreach.
Support Summons Reform

The Council calls on the Administration to support the summons reform within the City’s criminal justice system. Giving police an option to issue a civil summons for minor offenses would require expansion of the Office of Administrative Trials and Hearings (OATH). Furthermore, offering violators a community service option in lieu of a monetary penalty would require development of programs. OATH’s Fiscal 2017 Preliminary Budget is $39.9 million with 263 full-time positions. Expansion of OATH would require $26 million in Fiscal 2017.

Ensure Availability of Social Services in High Crime Areas

The Council calls on the Administration to develop the capacity to identify social service needs in communities plagued by crime. Identification of the 35 areas with the highest crimes rates should be followed with a coordinated, multi-agency plan to assist community needs and services and to provide targeted social services. The Council calls on the Administration to add $802,020 to the Mayor’s Office of Criminal Justice to coordinate the identification and delivery of these services.

Intensive Anti-Violence Programming on Rikers Island

The Department of Correction’s Fiscal 2017 Preliminary Budget includes $22 million beginning in Fiscal 2017 to expand the level of programming to five hours per day for all adults on Rikers Island. The programming will focus on re-entry services, substance abuse, behavioral health, incarcerated veterans, and gender responsive programming. While the Council applauds the Administration for expanding the level of programming for adults, the Administration should add an additional $2 million to the Fiscal 2017 budget to develop anti-violence programming for those who have demonstrated a propensity for violence so they will be less violent while incarcerated and released.

Translate Emergency Notifications

The Council calls upon the Administration to translate any electronic emergency notification issued by New York City Emergency Management (NYCEM) in the six most popular languages as determined by the Department of City Planning. The Fiscal 2017 budget should include approximately $3 million for NYCEM to translate messages.

Expand the Child Care Tax Credit and Include Adult Dependents

The City Child Care Credit is intended to reduce the cost of child care for low-income working parents. The lack of affordable child care is a major obstacle to being in the workforce for many parents, particularly when single. The Federal and State governments have similar credits, which combined come to $2,200 per child up through age 12 and adult dependent to offset allowable costs of care. The Federal credit, however, is not refundable, which means low income families are typically unable to use the credit. Like the State program, the City credit is refundable, but unlike the Federal and State credits, it’s restricted to children age three and younger, and doesn’t include adult dependents. The maximum City credit is set at 75 percent of the State credit. A family with a household gross income of $15,000 gets a maximum credit of $866 a year for one child and $1,732 for two or more children.

19 Household gross income is the total federal adjusted gross income of all members of a household. The household needs to have earned income to qualify for any of these credits.
A major limitation of the City credit is that it begins to phase out at a household gross income as low as $25,000, and fully phases out to zero at $30,000. Consequently, many low-income families are ineligible for the credit.

The City Council proposes to increase the income threshold for the full credit to $35,000, and phases out to zero at $45,000. This proposal would additionally deepen the maximum credit from its current 75 percent to 100 percent of the State credit. This would increase the maximum benefit from $866 to $1,155 a year for one child. The average benefit would be around $800. Finally, this proposal would expand the credit’s coverage to include adult dependents. The need to care for seniors and other adults unable to care for themselves is also a barrier to employment. This credit expansion will cost $42 million in Fiscal 2018.

**EITC for Those Without Custodial Children**

The City Council recommends quadrupling the maximum credit for singles or married couples without custodial children. This category of struggling low-wage earners has been singled out to receive an especially insignificant credit. While the federal EITC provides a maximum credit of $3,359 for a tax filer with one child, it assigns only 15 percent of that amount, or $503, for a filer without children. Consequently, the current City credit, being 5 percent of the federal, provides at most $25.

While the principle objective of the EITC is to incentivize even the lowest-paying employment, this inducement is entirely lacking for a large segment of the population with no custodial children. Many persons in this category have a very tenuous attachment to the workforce, and the wage subsidy the credit provides plays a critical role in encouraging them to persevere. Many actually have children, but are waiting until they become financially stable before resuming parental responsibilities.

The current proportion between benefits of those with and without children is fundamentally irrational, baring no reflection of their relative costs of living. While there is a significant cost in raising a child, overall living expenses, including rent and food, for a person without children are certainly not as negligible as 15 percent of someone with custody of one child.

Turning to the City’s EITC, quadrupling the credit for childless workers from 15 percent to 60 percent of those with one child would at least provide a maximum credit of $100. The maximum credit for someone with one child is currently 60 percent of someone with two children. Extending that proportion would more closely achieve a rational scaling of filing status, while providing a maximum City credit of $100. Additionally, it will send a message to Washington D.C. and Albany to treat the employed poor without children in an even-handed and humane fashion. In addition to raising the maximum credit for working New Yorkers without qualifying children, there remains an additional inequity. The maximum credit phases out at a much lower income threshold for childless filers than those with children. A credit of a single filer with one child begins to phase out at $18,080, and completely phases out at $39,050. However, a credit for a single, childless filer begins to phase out at $8,224 and completely phases out at $14,794. Doubling the income thresholds would achieve fairness and the kind of proportional scaling enjoyed between filers with one, two or three children. This will benefit 520,000 New Yorker’s. The fiscal impact will entail a cost of $36 million in Fiscal 2017.

**Exempt Feminine Hygiene Products from the City’s Sales Tax**

Feminine hygiene products are a basic necessity – women have no choice but to buy such products. New York City’s sales tax does not treat them this way. Rather, feminine hygiene products are classified with cosmetics and toiletries and fully taxed.

---

20 The maximum federal EITC for a filer with one child is $3,305, and with two children is $5,460.
Tampons and similar products are already tax-exempt in a number of states, including Maryland, Pennsylvania, and New Jersey. New York City should join them and exempt feminine hygiene products from its 4.5 percent sales tax. We also recommend that the exemption be extended to the New York State and MTA portions of the sales tax. The New York City Council Finance Division estimates a revenue loss to New York City of approximately $2.37 million annually.

Restructure the Commercial Rent Tax

In the last few years, the City’s small businesses, especially retail stores and restaurants in the core areas of Manhattan, have been struggling more than usual. While it has never been easy to launch a business in New York City, high rents, corporate competition, and real estate development deals have heightened the struggles of small businesses. Currently, the Commercial Rent Tax (CRT) is imposed on businesses located in Manhattan south of 96th Street with annualized base rents of $250,000 or more per year. It is an unusual tax, with few equivalents elsewhere in the country.

The Council proposes to eliminate the CRT for all businesses paying less than $500,000 in annual base rent and impose the CRT with a partial credit for annual base rents between $500,000 and $550,000. The base rent exemption for the CRT was last increased in 2001, to $250,000. The last decade has seen an incredible rise in rents per square foot. According to Cushman and Wakefield, asking rents for retail space rose by as much as 8.3 percent in some parts of Manhattan last year. Outside of retail, small businesses typically use class B office space, whose asking rents in Manhattan rose by almost 7.1 percent in 2015, according to Collier International. With higher rents, the exemption is leaving out more and more small businesses and it needs to be increased to appropriately address today’s challenges. This proposal would reduce CRT revenues by $53 million in Fiscal 2017.

Targeted Property Tax Relief

Over the last few years, New York City has seen extraordinary growth in the value of its real estate. Rising real estate prices are a by-product of success, consistent with the City’s record employment and record population. The downside for many homeowners is that these record values have in turn pushed up property tax bills. At the same time, income growth in the City has been much less robust and has not kept pace with the fast growth of property taxes. Although homeowners may be thrilled that their homes are worth more, increases in tax bills at this pace prove difficult for many families.

While simple solutions may seem attractive, addressing this problem in a fiscally responsible way is made more difficult by the inequalities within the system and the limits of New York City’s powers over its taxes. Just about any change to New York City’s property tax system requires authorization by New York State. The New York State Constitution reserves the power to tax for the State Legislature and the State has not been generous in delegating taxing authority to the City. With these limited powers, the Council’s role in property tax reform is mainly focused on advocacy and oversight. Therefore, it is vital that the Mayor and the City Council are on the same page, and that they work with the State and advocate for change.

Some of the inequalities in the system are exemplified by homeowners with similar market values, who can pay a very different property tax in different parts of the City.\(^{21}\) Properties in neighborhoods with rapidly rising values, such as parts of brownstone Brooklyn, pay lower taxes than homes with the exact same value in slower growing areas such as Staten Island. This is the consequence of a provision in the law designed to protect homeowners. The assessment of co-ops and condos is even more inequitable.

\(^{21}\) This is true of owners of 1-3 family homes and owners of larger properties with ten or fewer units. These properties are subject to assessment caps.
with high value prewar co-ops on the Upper East Side of Manhattan being assessed as if they are rent stabilized properties. Because of this, blanket measures that do not look at the inequalities of income or of the property tax are not very good at getting aid where it is needed at a reasonable cost to the City budget. To that end, there are reforms that can be done. Just one example would be a circuit breaker which focuses tax relief on those whose property tax to income ratio indicates that they are burdened by the tax.

The City Council calls upon the Mayor and New York State, the entity with the ultimate power to authorize reform, to work with the City Council in providing targeted relief to New York City homeowners under stress from the rapid rise in property taxes.

**Young Women’s Initiative – Private, Public Partnership**

Speaker Melissa Mark-Viverito launched the Young Women’s Initiative in May 2015, beginning a groundbreaking collaboration between the New York City Council, advocates, philanthropy, and the Administration to address the needs of New York City’s young women, particularly young women of color. From September 2015 through April 2016, community based organizations, grassroots partners and cisgender and transgender women and girls met to discuss the disparities that young women and girls experience and make recommendations for short, medium, and long-term priorities. The City Council identified more than 200 community based organizations, policy experts, and young women to participate in five issue-based working groups: Health, Education, Anti-Violence & Criminal Justice, Economic & Workforce Development, and Community Support & Opportunity. These working groups were led by a Steering Committee made up of thirty-one local and national advocates, community leaders, members of City Council and key stakeholders from the Mayoral Administration, and informed by the Young Women’s Advisory Council, twenty-eight youth experts between the ages of 14-25 who had been recommended by members of the Steering Committee. Each working group was tasked with issue identification, service landscape appraisal, identification of best practices, and recommendation creation for review and consideration by the Council and the Administration.

In her 2016 State of the City speech, Speaker Mark-Viverito announced a $20 million commitment to support YWI recommendations over the next two years, $10 million of which will come from philanthropy.
Safeguarding the City’s Programs and Services Through Budget Stability

Building Reserves

A City with revenue sources as volatile as New York City’s business, transfer, and personal income taxes needs to plan for the ups and downs of the economy. Since the late 1990’s, the City has done so by building reserves. By Fiscal 2008, the City had amassed budget reserves that totaled $11 billion, or 18 percent of City funding. A significant portion of these reserves were used to navigate the “Great Recession”. As of today, the City’s budget reserves stand at $6 billion, or 10 percent of City funding. In order to prepare for a possible economic downturn, the Council calls on the administration to build its reserves.

However, it should be noted that there are issues with the system through which the City builds reserves. The Financial Emergency Act and the City Charter require the City to both adopt and to end the year with a balanced budget by Generally Accepted Accounting Procedures (GAAP) rules. Due to this budgeting requirement, the City is prohibited from using prior year surpluses in future years. Rather than having to spend the reserves each year, the City has developed a tool to “roll” forward prior year resources. Current practices are simply ways of getting around the GAAP requirement. The Budget Stabilization Account (BSA) and the Retiree Health Benefit Trust (RHBT) have limitations as ways of managing City’s reserves. Although considered a budget reserve, the RHBT’s primary purpose is to offset a large unfunded liability: health insurance for retirees. This unfunded liability topped $85 billion at the end of Fiscal 2015. The use of the RHBT as a reserve requires that its assets be kept highly liquid, thus earning low rates of interest. As for the BSA there is a limit to how much money can be used to prepay expenses. The New York State Constitution limits the amount the City can raise through the property tax for purposes other than debt service. If too much debt service is prepaid the City can find itself in the position of having to lower its property tax, thus offsetting the budgetary relief of the BSA.

Allow New York City to Create a Rainy Day Fund

The City should seek State authorization to create a rainy day fund. A rainy day fund would help create transparent and efficient cyclical budget management in which the City builds up these funds during good times and uses them in bad times. It would also resolve issues related to the City’s current budget reserve system and allow the RHBT to invest with these long-term issues in mind.

Under this proposal, the City would be allowed to establish, as a separate unit of appropriation in the expense budget, a rainy day fund. It would also be allowed to establish rules for the operation of the fund, including rules for deposits to and withdrawals from the fund.

Establish Rules to Govern the Retiree Health Benefits Trust

In order to better align with its intended purpose, the City should establish rules to govern how deposits and withdrawals are made to and from the Retiree Health Benefits Trust. As it stands now, health care benefits that we have promised to workers are not guaranteed by the State Constitution, so the City has an obligation to ensure that these funds are not only protected, but allowed to grow. There should be clear and binding rules delineating the contribution process to ensure its sustainability.

The City should set minimum RHBT deposit amounts as a percentage based on the value of the previous year’s annual premium for health care. In normal times the City’s contributions should exceed the cost of retiree health insurance for that year. There should be provisions to reduce or eliminate these deposits in years in which the City tax revenues grow unusually slow or decline.
Carried Interest and the Mansion Tax

There are two changes in tax policy that are important to do for reasons of equity, which would provide revenue well suited to funding increases in budgetary reserves. What the two taxes have in common is their volatility. They would rapidly rise in good times and fall precipitously in bad times when realizations on private equity or hedge funds fall and housing sales slump.

Carried Interest. The City’s unincorporated business tax (UBT) provides a tax break to management firms that run private equity funds, venture capital funds, angel funds, hedge funds, and certain real estate funds. The management firm is typically compensated by the fund through the right to receive 20 percent of profits from any investment gain they earn as partners in the fund. The 20 percent of the profits is referred to as “carried interest”.

Although carried interest is essentially compensation for management, it is not treated that way in the tax code. The IRS views it as a type of investment income and treats it as a “long-term capital gain,” which under the Federal tax code is taxed at a lower rate than ordinary income. Investment income gets no special treatment on the City’s personal income tax, but it does on the City’s UBT. Individuals or unincorporated entities that are primarily engaged in investment on their own account do not pay the UBT on income related to this investment. Therefore, since the IRS treats carried interest as investment income, this income is exempt from the UBT.

It is hard to think of why the compensation to these fund management companies should be treated differently from income to any other partnerships, such as a law firm, auto repair shop, cheese shop, or medical partnership. Taxing carried interest will result in an estimated $200 million in revenue for the City in Fiscal 2017.

Mansion Tax. The City’s property tax does not do a good job of taxing high value residences, especially high value coops and condominiums. This proposal would address that by imposing higher tax rates on the transfers of residential real property over $1.75 million. The tax would have two rates: 1.0 percent on the first $5 million of the transaction, and 1.5 percent on any additional amount over $5 million. The tax would apply to premises that may be used in whole or in part as a personal residence, and would include one, two, or three-family homes, individual condo units, and individual co-op units. Because it would target owners of reasonable wealth, the tax is also more progressive than if it were imposed on all owners. Imposing the mansion tax will result in an estimated $210 million in revenue for the City in Fiscal 2017.

Open Budget

The budget is the most important public policy the City regularly makes. As such its transparency is crucial to helping New Yorkers understand how the City spends and raises funding. While OMB publically provides many budget documents, all of them are in portable document format (pdf), making analysis of them cumbersome at best and impossible at worst. Like other agencies, OMB should publish excel files of its documents such as the supporting schedules, departmental estimates, and other applicable documents.

Improve Transparency of the Five-Year School Capital Plan

In the January 2016 Proposed Amendment to the Fiscal 2015-2019 Five-Year Capital Plan, the School Construction Authority (SCA) proposed to add $1.4 billion to the DOE’s $14.9 billion plan. The total plan includes $5.6 billion for capacity projects, $5.6 billion for capital investment projects and $3.7 billion for mandated programs. The Five-Year Capital Plan contains 38 appendices listing projects, most without dollar amounts, sites, or project schedules. Appendices list both planned, in-progress and completed projects, but never indicate which category a project falls into. Given the size, density, and importance
of this Plan, every project listed in every appendix should include the estimated or actual cost, the location or site, and the planned start date or completion date. Every appendix should indicate which projects have been completed. Furthermore, the SCA should publish its Capital Plan appendices in Excel.

Whether its Pre-K capacity, lighting fixture replacements, Super-Storm Sandy projects, student bathroom upgrades, or anything of the like, it would help the Council in their oversight duties and the City at large if it were more transparent what these projects cost, where they are located, when they will be starting and when they will be finished.

**Improve the Education Capital Planning Process**

Based on a June 2015 Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) between the City Council, the Department of Education, and the Mayor, the DOE is required to submit an annual amendment to the Five-Year Plan to the Council no later than March 1st of each year. Traditionally, in advance of this deadline, the SCA has also submitted a proposed amendment in November (the “November Amendment”) in order to give the City Council and the Community Education Councils an opportunity to provide feedback and site suggestions for building projects. However, for the second year in a row, DOE has unilaterally decided to delay publication of its proposed amendment and suspend the longstanding practice of collaboration with the Council and other stakeholders in development of the annual amendment to the Five-Year Plan.

This year, the proposed amendment was not released until January. Also, for the second year in the row, the DOE has delayed release of the annual amendment past the March 1st deadline agreed upon in the MOU. Last year, the amendment was not released until May 2015. Although the DOE assured the Council during the Fiscal 2016 budget hearings that the Fiscal 2017 amendment would be released on time, the March 1st deadline has already passed. It is from this proposed amendment that the Council performs its final analysis of the SCA’s Five-Year Capital Plan before voting to adopt the City’s budget in June.

The DOE and the Administration should adhere to the terms of the MOU as well as the long standing practice of collaborating with the Council to develop the Plan. The SCA should offer Council delegations status reports on capital projects every fall so that Council Members can establish priorities and direct the work of the SCA. Without the advice of Council Members, the DOE may continue to misallocate its capital resources.

**Ensure Transparency and Accountability in ThriveNYC**

The Council calls for transparency and accountability as the Administration rolls out the $850 million ThriveNYC Mental Health Roadmap. Specifically, the Council wants to ensure that established community-based organizations are able to participate in ThriveNYC projects and contribute to funding and planning discussions, particularly as they relate to implementation roadblocks. The Council also contends that the Administration should incorporate the concerns of the public and the provider community as it implements ThriveNYC. There are no costs associated with this proposal.

**Establish Neighborhood Commitment Plans**

The Administration should prepare Neighborhood Commitment Plans that report and track commitments that are made for housing, schools, infrastructure, and other City services in areas that will be rezoned in connection to the Administration’s *Housing New York* plan. The neighborhoods currently being considered for a rezoning to allow for more residential capacity and support the goals outlined in *Housing New York* include: East New York, Brooklyn (Council Districts 37 and 42); Long Island
City, Queens (Council District 26); Jerome Avenue Corridor, the Bronx (Council Districts 14 and 16); Flushing West, Queens (Council District 20); Bay Street Corridor, Staten Island (Council District 49); and East Harlem, Manhattan (Council Districts 8 and 9). It is critical that the Council has information pertaining to infrastructure development in these areas as the Housing Plan moves forward.

Capital Projects Tracker for Rezoned Neighborhoods

A key initiative of the Mayor’s housing plan to build or preserve 200,000 units of affordable housing is the rezoning of neighborhoods to encourage the development of more market rate and affordable housing. As part of that initiative, the Administration has committed to making improvements to rezoned communities to help handle and ameliorate the influx of new residents. Commitments like these have been made in past rezonings, but often there was no easy way for the public to track the progress or outcome of those commitments.

As part of the agreement that secured the Council’s approval of the Administration’s zoning reforms for Mandatory Inclusionary Zoning and Zoning for Quality and Affordability, the Administration agreed to publish reports on the neighborhood commitments made as part of rezonings. To make those reports more accessible, the Council calls on the Administration to create an interactive website that would allow members of the public to better understand and track the progress of capital projects funded in the rezoned neighborhoods. The Council believes that the development such a website would cost no more than $10 million.
Building for Our City’s Future

The City’s network of infrastructure projects is the thread that binds the City together. The City spends billions of dollars annually to rebuild, restore and upgrade its infrastructure. These everyday projects, transit, roadway, parks, hospitals, libraries, fire engines, and improvements to the water system make a critical difference in the quality of life for all New Yorkers. The Council is encouraged by the progress that has been made so far, but with so much at stake we must find more ways to prudently invest the City's resources in building and expanding the City’s infrastructure. For this reason, the Council calls on the Administration to include capital funding in the Fiscal 2017 Executive Budget for the below projects to ensure that we continue to build for our City’s future.

Address the Capital Needs of the City’s Libraries

The Council urges the Administration to provide adequate capital funding for libraries to help maintain and revitalize these critical institutions. The three systems together have more than $250 million in critical maintenance needs. The Council believes $100 million should be added to the capital budget of the libraries in Fiscal 2017 to address capital challenges, as well as establish an annual funding level that will solve the most pressing problems and move away from the process of piecemeal solution to deficiencies. Sufficient funding will allow the library systems to be compliant with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA), increase the amount of health and life safety projects offered, update heating and cooling systems, upgrade roofs, conduct full branch renovations, restore façades, and provide technology upgrades. It should be noted that Infrastructure problems also have a direct, negative impact on programming.

Richmond University Medical Center Emergency Room Renovation

Richmond University Medical Center’s emergency department is currently housed in an over 30 year old building designed to accommodate approximately 22,000 patients per year with average acuity. Today, the emergency room accommodates an average of 65,000 patients per year with a significantly higher acuity. The Council calls on the Administration to provide $10 million in capital funds to support the renovation of Richmond University Medical Center’s Emergency Room.

Complete Priority Education Projects

In late January the School Construction Authority (SCA) released a proposed amendment to the Fiscal 2015-2019 Five Year Capital Plan for schools. As is the practice, Council Members recommend capital projects for inclusion in the revised proposed amendment. In order to identify the capital needs citywide, Council Members reach out to principals, Community Education Councils, and Parent Associations and visit schools for input.

Last year, 693 proposals were submitted by the Council and only 8 were being considered for inclusion in the Plan. Of the remaining projects, 88 were already in the capital plan or completed and 51 were referred to maintenance. An additional 38 projects were being partially completed. The remaining 508 projects (73.3 percent of all projects submitted) were labeled “no funding available.” The Council is requesting that the SCA amend the Five-year Plan to fund a far greater number of the upgrade and repair projects prioritized by the Council. The SCA should fund these priorities internally from existing resources in their $14.9 billion plan.

School Bathroom Upgrades

DOE’s Five-Year Capital Plan includes a major, $100 million student bathroom renovation initiative approved by the City Council. However, the SCA has failed to include basic, essential, amenities such as
trash receptacles in stalls, hooks for bathroom stall doors and single faucet sinks in renovated bathrooms. DOE must now ensure they are provided in all student bathrooms and SCA must improve its bathroom projects.

Small trash receptacles inside bathrooms stalls are essential in all girls’ and gender neutral bathrooms so female students can properly dispose of tampons and sanitary napkins. This should be provided in all middle, elementary and high schools bathrooms. Additionally, many bathroom stalls do not have hooks to hang personal belongings. Often students do not have lockers at school and must carry their coats and backpacks with them all day. When students use bathroom facilities, they must put their coats and bags on the floor of the bathroom stall since hooks are not provided and this is not sanitary. Lastly, SCA should only install single faucet sinks for students. Currently, there are bathrooms throughout the city with double faucet sinks.

The Council proposes the DOE retrofit some bathrooms with expense funding to ensure all bathrooms have these essential fixtures. Going forward, SCA should include trash receptacles in stalls, hooks for bathroom stall doors and single faucet sinks in all bathroom upgrades using existing categorical resources.

### Air Condition Schools

According to National Weather Service data, the average number of hot-weather days in September, May, and June has grown by 25 percent in the last decade alone. Due to this change in climate, it has become more important than ever to air condition schools. Getting these buildings ready for expanded air-conditioning often requires electrical upgrades, which can be funded with City capital dollars. The Council is asking the SCA to include an initiative in the Five-Year Plan to upgrade wiring in school buildings citywide so that air-conditioning can be installed. Once upgraded, the DOE should fund the purchase the installation of these air conditioners.

These projects can range from a little over $1 million to $3 million per school, depending on the size of the school. The Department should fund these projects with existing resources.

### Purchase Large Front End Loaders

Currently, the Department of Sanitation (DSNY) maintains 65 salt storage locations throughout the City. At 22 of the 65 locations, DSNY uses small, less-efficient front end loaders to load trucks with salt to be dispersed on City streets. To increase efficiencies, the Council urges the Administration to include $5.4 million in capital funding to purchase 22 large front end loaders. The new equipment would enable DSNY to increase salt loading capacity at the salt storages facilities and re-deploy small front end loaders to the field for clearing snow on narrower streets.

### Increase Funding to Replace DSNY Vehicles

The Fiscal 2017 Preliminary Budget allocates $34.3 million to purchase 71 rear loaders and 44 dual bin trucks for DSNY operations. In order to comply with the seven-year average useful life standard and to address operational needs, the Council is calling upon the Administration to include an additional $53.2 million in capital funding to purchase 139 rear loaders and 46 dual bins.

### Graffiti Removal

As part of the City’s CleaNYC initiative, the New York City Economic Development Corporation (NYCEDC) has expanded its Graffiti Free NYC program by adding 24 new power-washing trucks to clean sidewalks along some of the City’s busiest corridors. This program is primarily focused on the removal of graffiti on
commercial, residential, and industrial properties. Although the City Council is pleased to hear of this expansion, the Council is dismayed that the Administration has ended the graffiti removal program for DOT properties, such as utility boxes, street signs, and light poles. The Council calls on the Administration to restore the DOT graffiti removal program.

**Build Out the Bicycle On-Street Network**

Currently, as required by local law, the Department of Transportation (DOT) constructs five lane miles of protected bike lanes each year. In addition, the Department also constructs 50 lane miles of bike lanes each year in accordance with the City’s Bike Lane Master Plan. In support of Vision Zero and because protected bike lanes save lives, the Council calls on the Administration to commit to the construction of 15 miles of protected bike lanes per year as the new minimum standard, and focus on previously identified priority corridors.

**Expand Citi Bike**

The Citi Bike program, operated by Motivate, has been expanded to neighborhoods in Brooklyn from Crown Heights to Red Hook, in Astoria, Queens and up to 130th Street in Manhattan. The completion of the Phase II Citi Bike expansion will bring the total program to 12,000 bikes and over 700 stations by the end of 2017. However, there are many neighborhoods that are not included in the program. In order to achieve equitable planning and development, the Council calls upon the Administration to join together with the Council, cycling advocates, and Motivate to discuss the appropriate and necessary level of Citi Bike expansion citywide.

**Improve Street Reconstruction**

The aim of the Complete Street program is to ensure that City streets are safe for all users and suitable for people of all ages and abilities. To ensure that the City’s arterial streets are maintained and redesigned within the industry standard of 50 years, the Council urges the Administration to increase the DOT capital budget by $240 million annually to ensuring that New York City can meet the industry standards of timely street reconstruction.

**Reconstruct Arterial Streets to Fulfill the City’s Pedestrian Safety Action Plan**

To achieve the goals of Vision Zero, the City must prioritize the redesign and reconstruction of its arterial streets. The reconstruction of arterial streets with Complete Street design changes including pedestrian refuge islands, dedicated bus and bike lanes, and slower speeds have proven to be successful in mitigating traffic fatalities. In fact, in places where the DOT has added Complete Street improvements, fatalities have decreased by 34 percent. The Council calls on the Administration to increase Street Improvement Projects from 80 to 98 projects per year and provide additional funding of $52.4 million to the DOT’s budget in Fiscal 2017. The increased funding will allow DOT to target the streets and intersections already identified as priorities, and integrate street safety improvements into its resurfacing program.

**Improve NYCHA Facilities**

NYCHA receives federal capital grants for infrastructure improvements and major rehabilitation of public housing buildings. Currently, there is a $17 billion gap between NYCHA’s projected federal capital funding and the cost to maintain the properties in state of good repair over the next five years. NYCHA reports, from 2001 to 2015, a cumulative federal capital grant funding loss of $1.27 billion compared to eligibility. As the capital needs of aging buildings grow, operating costs, such as maintenance and repair,
also increase. The Council’s allocations have attempted to fill critical capital funding gaps within NYCHA. For example, in Fiscal 2016, the City Council allocated $118.2 million to NYCHA for security measures, including closed-circuit television (CCTV) cameras and layered access security systems. While the Administration recently allocated $100 million over a three year period for a Roof Repair Program, more capital funding is needed to make critical infrastructure improvements. The Council calls on the Administration to provide $200 million in capital funds to NYCHA per year over the next five years, for a total commitment of $1 billion.

Construct a Department of Correction Training Academy
The Administration should increase the Department of Correction’s (DOC) Capital Budget by $50 million to build a new training facility. The Department of Correction’s current training facility is located in Queens and is in need of serious renovations. The academy does not meet the needs of the ever growing class sizes. In addition, the duration of the new recruit training, and the need to provide in-service training such as crisis management is prohibiting the DOC from providing state of the art training. The DOC requires a new training facility to be able to reach its authorized headcount. A new training facility is an essential part of the DOC’s plan to reform the Department.

Renovate the Emergency Medical Services Academy
The Administration should include $60 million in the Fiscal 2016-2019 Capital Budget to renovate and upgrade the Emergency Medical Services (EMS) academy on Fort Totten. EMS and fire units are responding to more medical emergencies than ever and a majority of the calls the Fire Department responds to are now medical emergencies. In order to keep up with the call volume, EMS will need to expand. FDNY plans to increase its Emergency Medical Technician (EMT) class size to 180 recruits, which is a step in the right direction. However, it does not address one of the core issues, which is infrastructure problems at Fort Totten. In general, the buildings are old and neglected and many of the divisions on Fort Totten are housed in old barrack style houses. According to the Department, the academy is outdated and overcrowded. Training supervisors are required to share desks and technology. Classroom space is limited and outdated and the facility does not have enough simulation training rooms for EMTs. These simulation training rooms prepare EMTs for real world challenges when dispatched to a call. The EMS academy on Fort Totten is a necessity for the Administration to ensure that EMS workers and firefighters are trained appropriately. The City should make a serious investment in Fort Totten and provide the Department with a modern training academy for EMS.

Construct Three New Emergency Medical Services Stations
The Administration should increase the FDNY’s Fiscal 2016-2019 Capital Budget by $60 million to build three additional EMS stations. As EMS headcount increases and EMS responds to more incidents, the need for additional EMS stations across the City grows. Unlike firefighters, a majority of EMS members do not have the luxury of going back to a firehouse after responding to an incident. EMS members will often sit in their ambulance until the next call comes in. Building more EMS stations will allow EMS members to recuperate in a station instead of their ambulance after responding to a call. Additional stations also allow for easier access to supplies, improved supervision, more in service training, and additional locker rooms. As the EMS headcount rises, it is necessary for the Department to build more EMS stations to accommodate the additional EMS members. Building more EMS stations shows a commitment to EMS and will improve morale in the EMS division.
Renovate Firehouses

The Administration should increase the Capital Budget for firehouse renovations by ten percent. The Fire Department plans to undertake approximately five firehouse renovations per year, however nearly all of the 218 firehouses need renovations. The Administration should increase the Fiscal 2016-2019 Capital Commitment Plan beyond the current funding level of $34.7 million for firehouse renovations by an additional ten percent, or $3.5 million. This would allow the Fire Department to perform these necessary renovations on additional firehouses.

Build Animal Shelters in Queens and the Bronx

In 2000, the City Council passed Local Law 26, the Animal Shelters and Sterilization Act, which required a full-service animal shelter in each of the five boroughs, defined as one that accepts dogs and cats 24 hours per day, seven days per week; has an adoption program seven days a week; and provides veterinary services. In 2011, the Animal Shelters and Sterilization Act was amended by Local Law 59, which repealed the requirement that there must be a full-service shelter in every borough. Currently, the City operates shelters with veterinary and adoption services in Manhattan, Brooklyn, and Staten Island, while Queens and the Bronx have only receiving centers. These two receiving centers do not have sufficient space to be converted into full-service shelters.

The Fiscal 2016 Executive Budget included $1.2 million and one full-time DOHMH position to conduct a feasibility study on animal shelter expansion. During the Fiscal 2017 Preliminary Budget hearing, DOHMH reiterated its commitment to establishing full-service animal shelters in every borough. In order to actualize these commitments, the Council strongly urges the Administration to include $10 million in capital funding to provide full-service animal shelters in the Bronx and Queens.

Invest in a Sustainable Regional Food System

The Fiscal 2017 budget should include an investment of at least $5 million to protect regional farms from being lost to real estate interests. A substantial and growing amount of fresh food from regional farms in the Hudson Valley makes its way into many under-resourced communities within New York City, where 3 million New Yorkers live in neighborhoods without adequate supermarkets, including 1.4 million who are food insecure. Yet 89 percent of the farmland in the Hudson Valley has not been conserved, and is at risk.

Protecting regional farms from real estate pressures that increasingly make farmland unaffordable to farmers is fundamental to building a vibrant and sustainable regional food economy in the City. The Mayor highlighted the importance of encouraging a sustainable, resilient food system as part of his #OneNYC plan, and this investment would represent a significant step towards this goal. Last year, a number of Council Members sought the Mayor’s support for a plan to provide local farmers with incentives and investments to increase productivity. Looking ahead, this effort should not just be limited to Fiscal 2017. The City should extend this $5 million investment to a yearly investment throughout the financial plan.
Baselining City Priorities

In Fiscal 2016, the funding added to the budget by the City Council supported a significant collection of services that maintain agency operations and other vital core programming. These include priority areas such as senior services, youth services, library services, legal services, public safety and criminal justice services, children's services, education, housing, and small business services. Given the importance of these initiatives, the Council urges the Administration to include baseline funds for services that are vital to agency operations.

In considering which services the Administration should baseline, the City Council developed a methodology for selecting services that meet one of the following criteria: (a) funding supports agency operations and is a budget restoration; (b) funding goes towards supporting an agency budget restoration and contracts were procured by the Administration; (c) funding addresses a service gap and is designated by the agency; (d) funding is designated to one contracted organization where the agency has an existing contract; (e) funding addresses a specific function of the agency; or (f) the scope of the initiative is aligned to the agency's mission and not funded by Administration or other government sources. Based on these criteria, the following programs should be funded in Fiscal 2017 and beyond.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Programs and Services</th>
<th>Fiscal 2017 Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Priority 5 Childcare Vouchers</td>
<td>$4,400,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Treatment Alternatives for Safer Communities (TASC)</td>
<td>$250,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bridge to Tomorrow</td>
<td>$1,150,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAMPS</td>
<td>$125,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executive Leadership Institute</td>
<td>$450,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LGBT Students' Liaison</td>
<td>$200,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Small Schools Athletic League</td>
<td>$1,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban Advantage</td>
<td>$3,500,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emergency Food Assistance Program</td>
<td>$22,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Merit-Based Scholarships for CUNY Students</td>
<td>$17,500,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HPD Alternative Enforcement Program</td>
<td>$750,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NYCHA Senior Centers</td>
<td>$3,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CUNY Citizenship Now</td>
<td>$1,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anti-Eviction and SRO Legal Services</td>
<td>$5,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citywide Civil Legal Services</td>
<td>$3,750,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commission on Human Rights</td>
<td>$1,510,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal Services for the Working Poor</td>
<td>$1,725,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medicaid Managed Care Transition</td>
<td>$500,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parks Enforcement Patrol</td>
<td>$6,017,458</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parks Equity Initiative</td>
<td>$1,650,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parks Maintenance</td>
<td>$9,553,205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tree Stump Removal</td>
<td>$1,054,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anti-Gun Violence - Evaluation</td>
<td>$250,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anti-Gun Violence - Legal Services</td>
<td>$1,175,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Juvenile Robbery Intervention Program</td>
<td>$1,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6th Congregate Weekend Meal</td>
<td>$1,200,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DFTA Case Management Services</td>
<td>$3,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DFTA Homecare Services</td>
<td>$4,250,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senior Centers and Programs</td>
<td>$3,578,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Space Costs for Senior Centers</td>
<td>$1,100,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportation Costs for Senior Centers</td>
<td>$660,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Small Business Services Administrative Fees</td>
<td>$794,300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Small Business/Job Development/Financial Literacy</td>
<td>$600,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vision Zero Public Education Campaign</td>
<td>$2,500,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Expanding and Enhancing Vital City Services

The Fiscal 2017 Preliminary Budget includes funding for services for New City’s most vulnerable populations, supporting a myriad of services for individuals grappling with mental illness, investing in initiatives to combat homelessness, expanding prevention services and support for individuals living with HIV and AIDS, and the baselining of elder abuse initiatives supported by the City Council. These investments will undoubtedly increase the quality of life for many New Yorkers, but at their current funded levels will not reach all New Yorkers who need them. Additionally, City agencies are not adequately funded to administer their programs, which will significantly impact the efficacy of this Administration’s major initiatives. Keeping these needs in mind, the Council calls for additional investments in criminal justice initiatives, community supports and human services that would offer valuable services and will reduce disparities for our city’s most vulnerable.

Create an Office for Crime Victims Services

The Council calls on the Administration to create the Office of Crime Victim Services within the Mayor’s Office of Criminal Justice. Establishing a crime victim services office and coordinator would provide a location where crime victims could receive information and guidance on existing services in each borough. This office would also be tasked with the improvement and coordination of existing services that promote the rights, needs, and interests of the City’s victims of violent crimes. The estimated cost for this office is $802,020.

Create an Office to End Gun Violence

The Council calls on the Administration to create an Office to End Gun Violence. The Office would have a focus on Citywide efforts to reduce incidences of gun violence. It would oversee programs, such as the New York City Crisis Management System, to ensure that programs collaborate and cover neighborhoods impacted by gun violence. The office would develop a unified message for the City on ending gun violence. Currently efforts by the City are varied and disconnected. An office would allow for a coordinated and collaborated response. The estimated cost for the creation of the Office to End Gun Violence totals $6 million.

Civilianize 200 Positions at the Police Department

The Council renews its call for the Police Department to continue returning additional officers to police duties by hiring more civilian staff. A significant cohort of police officers has long been assigned to administrative and clerical duties. This leaves fewer uniformed personnel performing critical public safety functions in our communities than the budgeted levels would indicate. In the past two fiscal years, the Council and the Administration increased the NYPD’s civilian headcount by over 600 positions. In Fiscal 2016, the budget added funding to hire 415 civilians. However, the Department has hired only approximately 60 civilians, which has stalled the Department’s ability to redeploy the more officers to patrol duties. In order to maximize existing uniform staff, the Council calls upon the Administration to continue civilianization at the NYPD. In the NYPD’s fourth quarter report for calendar year 2015 to the City Council, the Department reported 593 full-duty officers in patrol and administrative commands performing civilian functions. This headcount does not include officers that are on limited, restricted, or modified duties. The Council calls upon the Administration to increase civilian staff by hiring 200 Police Administrative Aides (PAAs). The total cost to hire 200 PAAs in Fiscal 2017 is $7.1 million, which includes fringe benefits.
Create a Municipal Department of Transitional Services

The City should create a Municipal Division of Transitional Services (MDOTS) to coordinate the provision of re-entry programs and services to those leaving City jails. MDOTs should be located in communities where people leaving jail are returning. MDOTS hubs would provide resources such as access to computers, resume building classes, job training, housing, counseling, and access to benefits. While MDOTS should provide services to all formerly incarcerated individuals, the program will be particularly important for those individuals that did not receive a discharge plan before leaving City jails.

To ensure MDOTS would serve all re-entrants Citywide, MDOTS will need a presence in each borough and close to Rikers Island. The total cost for to staff MDOTS is estimated to be $1.9 million in the first fiscal year.

Inspector General for Department of Correction

The Council calls on the Administration to expand the role of the Inspector General for the Department of Correction. The Inspector General would focus on systemic issues that lead to inmate mistreatment and offer clarification on the oversight duties of the inspector general. This expansion would be similar to the creation of the Inspector General for the New York Police Department. Existing resources at the various reporting agencies would be used to support this expansion.

Fully Fund District Attorneys Budget Needs

The Council urges the Administration to fully fund the budget needs of the five District Attorneys. A collective increase of $21.8 million would support several new initiatives and adequately fund core functions. During the Fiscal 2017 Preliminary Budget Hearing for the Committee on Public Safety, each office presented several requests that reflect the growing demands of each office. The following are the budget requests made by each office.

- **Bronx:** $11.5 million to support the implementation of vertical integration prosecution, creation of a Rikers Island Bureau, a conviction integrity unit, and other enhancements.
- **Staten Island:** $3 to enhance staffing, create of a community partnerships unit, baseline the Treatment Alternatives for Safer Communities, and other enhancements.
- **Brooklyn:** $1 million to expand the crime strategies unit, the forensic science unit and to acquire additional storage space.
- **Manhattan:** Create an Alternatives to Incarceration Unit - $600,000.
- **Queens:** $4.9 million for a variety of needs, such as detectives squad personnel, an enhanced IT units, additional appeals bureau staff, and an anti-violence initiative unit.

Provide Video Visitations

The Administration should establish a citywide video visitation program in neighborhood centers and local libraries. Studies have indicated that maintaining contact with one’s community during a period of incarceration is a significant factor in reducing recidivism. However, visiting inmates at Rikers Island is difficult for many of their friends and family members. Rikers is not easily accessible, and upon arrival the procedures for visitation are lengthy and burdensome. Establishing a video visitation program to complement in-person visits would provide numerous benefits to families, including maintaining ties with their friends and families while incarcerated and supporting successful reentry into our communities when released. Establishing library access points across the City provides the added
benefit of educational opportunities such as allowing parents to read with their children while incarcerated and a myriad of potential educational programs to help create a bridge back into our communities. The estimated cost to develop this program citywide is approximately $3.5 million. This includes funding for video visitation terminals on Rikers Island and additional video visitation equipment installed citywide.

Expand the Mayor's Action Plan for Neighborhood Safety

In July 2014, the Administration announced a comprehensive multi-agency effort to address public safety concerns and promote crime reduction in 15 NYCHA developments with exceptionally high levels of violent crime. During the two-year period, Fiscal 2014 to Fiscal 2015, $211.3 million has been invested in the MAP initiative. Investments include: $122 million for NYCHA repairs and maintenance; $50 million for physical improvements to enhance security; $1.5 million for exterior lighting; $21.7 million for police overtime pay; $10.2 million for expanded community center hours; and $5.9 million to expand other key programs. The Administration should provide $40 million in the Fiscal 2017 Budget for MAP programs in an additional five NYCHA developments as well as additional capital investments.

Enhance the New York City Crisis Management System

The Council renews its call for the Administration to fully support and increase funding for the Anti-Gun Violence Initiative, also known as the New York City Crisis Management System. In Fiscal 2016, the Council and the Administration invested a total of $19.9 million in the New York City Crisis Management System to provide a comprehensive and community-based approach to addressing gun violence. The Crisis Management System includes a variety of programs such as cure violence, community therapeutic services, school-based conflict mediation and youth development programs, legal services, youth employment, job readiness training, arts programming, and a peer leadership committee. The Council calls on the Administration to fund several components of the initiative:

- Baseline Legal Services in the New York City Crisis Management System - $1,175,000
- Baseline Evaluation services - $250,000
- Fully fund cure violence and hospital based programs in these four precincts - 42nd, 75th, 77th, and the 79th precincts - $2,530,000
- Provide full support to Cure Violence programs in the 23rd, 32nd, 47th, 60th, and the 114th precincts to bring these five start-up sites to full sites - $1,500,000
- Expand of the following NYC Crisis Management wrap around services - $8,835,000
  - Expand Cure Violence Programming in ACS Non-Secure Placement Sites - $500,000
  - Expand the Training Academy - $500,000
  - Add Three Additional Hospital Based Programming - $795,000
  - Expand Professional Mental Health Services - $1,040,000
  - City Council Employment Program - $6,000,000

Funding would fully support efforts in the 18 catchment areas to reduce incidences of gun violence using a public health and community-based approach. The total cost to fund these initiatives is $14.3 million in Fiscal 2017.

Implement Additional Emergency Medical Services Tours

In February 2016, TransCare, a private ambulance company that participated in the 911 EMS system in New York City through contractual agreements with several private hospitals filed for bankruptcy and ceased providing ambulance services. TransCare operated 27 ambulances in the Bronx and Manhattan for a total of 81 ambulance tours. The Department had been monitoring TransCare’s financial situation and had contingency plans in place for both short and long term solutions in anticipation of this event.
To ensure uninterrupted EMS services, the Department added ambulance units staffed on overtime to fill some of the vacancies created by TransCare and worked with the private hospitals to fill the others.

Currently the Department is running 45 of the 81 tours on overtime with hospitals in the area covering the remaining tours. While FDNY was prepared for this scenario and was able to fill those tours on overtime, this situation highlights the risk in the Department’s reliance on private ambulance tours. The Fiscal 2017 Budget should include $11.2 million for the Department to hire 181 additional positions in order to permanently take over the 45 tours the FDNY is operating on overtime. While it would be ideal for the Department to take over the entire 81 tours left vacant by TransCare immediately, it is not a realistic scenario, as the Department would need additional time to increase headcount. Additionally, FDNY should develop a long-term plan to take over the remaining 36 tours.

Enhance NYC Emergency Management’s Ability to Response to Emergencies

The New York City Emergency Management (NYCEM) requested a total of nine positions for $548,000 annually. These positions were three application developers for data management, one human services shelter manager, one plan manager, one after-action report coordinator, two training and exercise coordinators and one cyber security analyst. Of these requested positions, one was awarded in the Fiscal 2017 Preliminary Budget – the after-action report coordinator, the remaining eight positions have yet to be funded by the Administration. The Administration should add funding for the remaining eight positions.

Hire More School Crossing Guards

The Council renews its call to increase the budgeted headcount for school crossing guards. While the Administration increased the school crossing guard budgeted headcount by 80 positions in the Fiscal 2017 Preliminary Budget in response to the Council’s request, many critical locations remain uncovered. The Police Department should ensure that the crossing guard headcount is sufficient to cover all priority intersections. NYPD also assess the staffing needs in collaboration with the Department of Transportation and the Department of Education.

Expand the Nurse-Family Partnership

The Nurse-Family Partnership (NFP), an evidence-based maternal and early childhood health program, fosters long-term success for first-time mothers, their babies and society. An investment in NFP yields not only quantifiable social benefits, such as improved prenatal health, improved child health and development, and increased economic self-sufficiency, but also a substantial return on the community’s investment in the program.

The Fiscal 2017 Budget should include $8 million to expand NFP, potentially in the seven NYC community districts with the highest average infant mortality rates. NFP’s Targeted Citywide Initiative, a program that serves teens in foster care, women and teens in homeless shelters, women at Rikers Island, and teens involved in the juvenile justice system should also be expanded.

Establish a Neighborhood Naturally Occurring Retirement Communities Program

In Fiscal 2016, the Council allocated $1.9 million for Neighborhood Naturally Occurring Retirement Communities (NNORCs), which supports 15 NNORCs. NNORCs programs provide services to older adults living in low-density neighborhoods comprised of single-family homes and low rise buildings not originally built for senior citizens that have high concentrations of seniors. Like vertical Naturally Occurring Retirement Communities, NNORCs provide institutionalized health and social services to help senior citizens age in their homes and communities. City Council discretionary funding is the only City
funding provided to NNORCs, as the City does not have its own NNORC program. The Council calls upon the Administration to add $1.9 million in new baselined funding to DFTA to create a City funded NNORC program that builds upon the current State funded NNORC program in the City.

Support Naturally Occurring Retirement Communities

In Fiscal 2016, the Council allocated $1.95 million to enhance programs for 14 existing Naturally Occurring Retirement Communities. NORCs programs provide health and social services to older adults living in a single age-integrated apartment building, an area where a number of apartment buildings are clustered, and housing complexes where 50 percent of the units have an occupant who is elderly. These programs allow seniors to securely age in place as a part of a community. The proposed Fiscal 2017 budget for NORCs is approximately $6.3 million for 28 NORCs. The Administration should add $1.95 million to support establishment of additional NORCs across the City.

Enhance Access Health NYC

The Access Health NYC Initiative enables culturally and linguistically competent non-profit CBOs in all five boroughs to conduct outreach and education in their communities regarding options for healthcare access and coverage, particularly for the uninsured. Topics include Health + Hospitals options, Federally Qualified Health Centers (FQHC), pre-certification for emergency Medicaid, Medicaid for Pregnant Women/the Prenatal Care Assistance Program (PCAP), the Family Planning Extension Program (FPEP), the AIDS Drug Assistance Program (ADAP), and the Children’s Health Insurance Program (CHIP). While some private foundation funds were made available to aid efforts of outreach and education, the Access Health NYC Initiative allows CBOs to scale up their activities and to create a more robust public health education campaign.

Fiscal 2016 Council funding for the Access Health Initiative totals $1 million and supports 12 CBOs and federally qualified health centers in the City. Awardees include the Asian-American Coalition for Children and Families and Bronx AIDS Services. Based on service need and program capacity, the Administration should enhance Access Health funding to $4 million to enable these CBOs to expand their outreach and education efforts.

Coordinate PrEP Services at Syringe Exchange Program Sites

The Fiscal 2017 Preliminary Budget includes $23.5 million to enhance HIV/AIDS prevention and healthcare services and to end the HIV/AIDS epidemic in the City. The Council urges the Administration to employ a social justice framework when implementing Ending the Epidemic (ETE) initiatives, addressing the effects of poverty on people living with HIV/AIDS. Accordingly, the Council urges the Administration to implement a program that co-locates pre-exposure prophylaxis (PrEP) education and referral services at key syringe exchange sites in order to reach injection drug users. Council Finance expects this to cost the City $900,000.

Expand Turf Maintenance Crew

Since the start of the City’s PlaNYC 2030 program, the number of artificial turf fields under DPR’s jurisdiction has been growing and so is the need for the special care and maintenance of these fields beyond the usual seasonal cleanups. A dedicated and trained crew should be put in place to make repairs and better fix turf issues as they arise. As such, the Council calls on the Administration include $1.7 million in DPR’s budget in the Fiscal 2017 Executive Budget to hire additional turf maintenance crew.
Expand Seasonal Staff

Over the last decade, the Department of Parks and Recreation has been creative in maintaining the City’s park systems by doing more with less. Despite, the increase in usership of park facilities and the effort to ensure equity in parks, the Department’s funding level has remained fairly stagnant. As such, the Council urges the Administration to include additional baseline funding of $11 million in DPR’s budget in Fiscal 2017. The additional funding would allow DPR to further develop and expand it’s seasonal staff, including park workers, playground associates, gardeners, and other supervisors to ensure adequate staffing levels during the warmer months in which park usership is at its highest.

Increase Funding for Playground Associates

Playground associates play a vital role in our neighborhood parks by providing supervised recreation in the local parks and playgrounds. Currently, the Department of Parks and Recreation (DPR) has only 145 playground associates to serve all of the City’s 680 playgrounds that have comfort stations. Consequently, many City playgrounds lack the services of playground associates. City playgrounds remain a vital source of recreational opportunities for every New Yorker, and supervised recreational activities are crucial in fighting obesity and keeping our kids healthy. The Council calls on the Administration to include additional baseline funding of $6.4 million in DPR’s budget in Fiscal 2017 to hire 204 additional playground associates.

Increase Baseline Funding for the GreenThumb Program

Last year, the City announced the biggest addition to the Parks Department’s community garden system in more than a decade, transferring thirty-four interim garden sites from the Department of Housing Preservation and Development to DPR to be permanently assigned as GreenThumb gardens. Community gardens play an important role in the neighborhoods they serve by providing much needed green space to neighborhoods and schools. These gardens help to promote environmental education, encourage local food production and activate unused open spaces in neighborhoods. Because the Green Thumb program has historically relied on federal block grant funding which has been inadequate, the Council urges the Administration to include additional baseline funding of $750,000 in DPR’s budget in Fiscal 2017 to hire six Outreach Coordinators and six field technical staff—doubling the current levels—to better manage gardens and to hire more program staff to implement more education programs at the gardens and to help community groups resolve administrative issues.

Extend the Pool and Beach Season by One Week

The Department of Parks and Recreation (DPR) manages and operates the City’s 67 public pools and 14 miles of beaches. Currently, the City’s beach season lasts from Memorial Day Weekend to Labor Day, while the pool season lasts from the end of the school year to Labor Day Weekend. The Administration should extend the pool and beach season for one week beyond Labor Day. This would cost approximately $2.4 million in Fiscal 2017.

Deploy Neighborhood Support Teams

The Council calls on the Administration to develop a model multi-agency approach to address local, quality of life issues. These support teams would include community members, elected officials, and other stakeholders to identify and assess issues in the community. These neighborhood support teams would include agency partners to identify, coordinate, and deliver a multi-agency approach to addressing quality of life problems across the City. The estimated cost for the coordinating agency overseeing the deployment of these neighborhood support teams totals $802,020.
Improve Library Services

During the Bloomberg Administration the three library systems were forced to reduce hours, lay-off staff, and limit their circulation in an effort to adhere to budget reduction requirements. In Fiscal 2016, the City Council invested $21 million and the Mayor invested an additional $22 million approximately, for a total of $43 million, into the three Library systems to increase access to libraries and ensure 6-day service in every public library across the City. The library systems needed an additional $22 million to meet the increasing demand for their services and programs.

The Council urges the administration to baseline the full amount of $65 million to ensure continuity of 6-day service in all library branches. Restoring funding will allow libraries to magnify the impact of their programs by leveraging their wide spread reach and unique standing in communities, hire more staff, increase operating hours, increase materials and overall serve the borough in a significant manner.

Supports Arts and Culture

New York City is the cultural capital of the world. New York’s arts and culture are integral to furthering the aspirations of our city’s youth and it is crucial that the youth get an art-rich education. Not only do the cultural institutions and organizations draw, and inspire millions of people they are also a medium of economic development for the City.

Hence the Council would like the Administration to invest in the culture and arts by increasing funding for arts and culture by $40 million. The funding would be split between Cultural Institution Group members and small community-based nonprofit cultural organizations throughout the city. Funding will support additional programs that will reach individuals in all five boroughs and will enrich the lives of artists, students, seniors and all New Yorkers. Currently funded organizations will be able to sustain and grow and new organizations will be accessible to New Yorkers to benefit from. To ensure that world-class art is available to maximum New Yorkers, the Council urges the administration to increase the funding to allow our future generations to continue to access and benefit from the rich culture of New York City.

Support Worker Cooperatives

Worker cooperatives are businesses that are owned and managed solely by their employees and, therefore, help build assets and wealth among low-income individuals and communities and create entrepreneurs and community leaders. The Council’s Worker Cooperative Business Development Initiative (WCBDI) supports these businesses through education and training resources and by providing technical, legal and financial assistance. As a result of the Council’s $3.3 million investment since the initiative’s inception in Fiscal 2015, New York City is home to the largest worker coop community in the United States, with 67 cooperatively-run businesses expected to be thriving in the City by the end of Fiscal 2016.

To ensure the continued success of WCBDI, the Department of Small Business Services’ (SBS) role in assisting worker co-ops in accessing City contracts as well as a broader client base including anchor institutions must be expanded. The Council therefore proposes that the Administration baselines $300,000 to cover three SBS staff who would provide business development and other support to help grow the Worker Cooperatives.
Tracking the City’s Progress

Understanding the City’s budget requires more than just a knowledge of the amounts allocated and spent in each unit of appropriation; it requires an understanding of the outcome and impact of that spending. As part of its budget oversight responsibilities, the Council depends heavily on performance data provided by the City’s agencies to understand how well City services are being delivered and where gaps might exist.

The Mayor’s Management Report (MMR) and associated Preliminary Mayor’s Management Report (PMMR) are key sources of this information, particularly as they are released on a cycle that dovetails with the budget process. The Preliminary MMR provides an early update of how the City is performing four months into the fiscal year. The full-fiscal MMR, published each September, looks retrospectively at the City’s performance during the prior fiscal year. These documents serve as a public account of the performance of City agencies, measuring whether they are delivering services efficiently, effectively and expeditiously.

As City priorities shift, and new programs are added, it becomes important to confirm that the City’s MMR and PMMR capture a clear, representative, and comprehensive picture of services and performance. To that end, the Council has identified the following performance measures that should be included in future MMRs.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AGENCY</th>
<th>INDICATOR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACS</td>
<td>Average daily population in detention disaggregated by juvenile offenders and juvenile delinquents as well as by age</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACS</td>
<td>Add limited secure placement indicators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACS</td>
<td>Reinstate deleted foster care and adoption indicators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COIB</td>
<td>Conflicts of Interest Board Performance Measures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DCAS</td>
<td>Average time from Board of Standards &amp; Appeals applications to decision</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DCAS</td>
<td>Indicators for the Board of Standards and Appeals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DCAS</td>
<td>Number of Provisional Employees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DCAS</td>
<td>Estimated reduction in greenhouse gas emissions from energy projects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DCLA</td>
<td>Visits to CIGS and Indicators for Program Sessions and Attendance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DFTA</td>
<td>Number of eligible seniors denied case management services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DFTA</td>
<td>Number of eligible seniors denied homecare services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DFTA</td>
<td>Number of Social Adult Day Care Programs Registered with DFTA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DFTA</td>
<td>Number of seniors receiving or utilizing NORC services, disaggregated by borough</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DFTA</td>
<td>Senior centers and meal indicators disaggregated by borough</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DHS</td>
<td>Number of families receiving Domestic Violence Services intervention while in shelters.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DHS</td>
<td>Number of clients engaged in shelter programming</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOC</td>
<td>Average number of visitors to Rikers Island</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOC</td>
<td>Number of inmate discharges</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOE</td>
<td>Metrics on school food, including average costs and usage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOF</td>
<td>Indicators for Business E-Service System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOF</td>
<td>Indicators for Business Tax Service Unit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOF</td>
<td>Indicators for Office of Taxpayer Advocate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOHMH</td>
<td>Insecticide-spraying performed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOHMH</td>
<td>Buildings reporting unsafe lead levels in drinking water</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOHMH</td>
<td>Immunization rate by age group and borough</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DSNY</td>
<td>Percent of streets rated acceptably clean by borough</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DSNY</td>
<td>Percent of sidewalks rate acceptably clean by borough</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EDC</td>
<td>Percent of private sector jobs in the Fashion, Industrial, Life Sciences, Media &amp; Emerging Tech, Social Enterprises, or Urban Innovation &amp; Sustainability Sectors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EDC</td>
<td>Percent of EDC capital projects by borough</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EDC</td>
<td>Percent of private sector jobs categorized by high, medium, or low wage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EDC</td>
<td>Percent of project employees that are female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EDC</td>
<td>Percent of finished projects that were completed on time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AGENCY</td>
<td>INDICATOR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FDNY</td>
<td>Ambulance tours per day on overtime</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FDNY</td>
<td>New fire recruits, fire officers, EMS officers, EMTs, and paramedics trained</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FDNY</td>
<td>Fire protection inspectors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FDNY</td>
<td>Revenue for fire inspections</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FDNY</td>
<td>Top five causes of accidental fires investigated by the bureau of fire prevention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FDNY</td>
<td>Engine, ladder, ambulance, and rescue/haz-mat vehicles downtime</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FDNY</td>
<td>Number of firehouses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FDNY</td>
<td>Number of EMS stations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H+H</td>
<td>Average wait time for a primary care visit at hospitals and diagnostic treatment centers in minutes for pediatric medicine and women's health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRA</td>
<td>Number of Living in Communities (LINC) move outs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRA</td>
<td>Number of City Family Eviction Prevention Subsidy (FEPS) move outs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HRA</td>
<td>Number of clients that leveraged HRA’s anti-eviction legal services and were diverted from shelter.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Law</td>
<td>Judgements and Claims Spending</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SBS</td>
<td>Number of registered Workforce1 Career Center jobseekers who have yet to find jobs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ThriveNYC</td>
<td>Number of CBOs reached through CBO Action Guide</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ThriveNYC</td>
<td>Number of students reached through CUNY Digital Platforms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ThriveNYC</td>
<td>Number of agencies/providers reached through Innovation Lab</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ThriveNYC</td>
<td>Estimated reach of Roadmap media campaign</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ThriveNYC</td>
<td>Number of Mental Health Corps workers trained; placed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ThriveNYC</td>
<td>Number of instructors trained in Mental Health First Aid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ThriveNYC</td>
<td>Number of calls received</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ThriveNYC</td>
<td>Number of peer specialists trained</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ThriveNYC</td>
<td>Number of mental health consultants trained; placed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ThriveNYC</td>
<td>Number of children treated through Social-Emotional program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ThriveNYC</td>
<td>Number of people trained in social-emotional competencies</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Continuation from previous page*